

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING OF THE  
NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL

----- X

December 9, 2021  
Start: 2:19 p.m.  
Recess: 6:00 p.m.

HELD AT: Hybrid Hearing -  
Council Chambers City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson  
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne Adams  
Alicka Ampry-Samuel  
Diana Ayala  
Inez D. Barron  
Joseph Borelli  
Justin. L Brannan  
Selvena Brooks-Powers  
Tiffany Cabán  
Fernando Cabrera  
David Carr  
Robert Cornegy, Jr.  
Darma Diaz  
Ruben Diaz  
Eric Dinowitz  
Daniel Dromm  
Mathieu Eugene  
Oswald Feliz

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

James F. Gennaro  
Vanessa L. Gibson  
Mark Gjonaj  
Barry S. Grodenchik  
Robert F. Holden  
Ben Kallos  
Peter Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Brad S. Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Farah Louis  
Alan N. Maisel  
Carlos Menchaca  
I. Daneek Miller  
Francisco Moya  
Bill Perkins  
Keith Powers  
Antonio Reynoso  
Kevin Riley  
Carlina Rivera  
Ydanis Rodriguez  
Deborah L. Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Mark S. Treyger  
Eric A. Ulrich  
Peter Vallone  
James G. Van Bramer  
Inna Vernikov  
Kalman Yeger  
Laurie Cumbo

Reverend Paul Daniels  
Cathedral of Saint John the Divine



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 4

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good afternoon,  
3 everyone. Welcome to today's New York City Council  
4 Stated Meeting. At this time would all panelists  
5 please turn on your videos? To minimize disruption,  
6 please place electronic devices to vibrate or silent.  
7 Thank you. We are ready to begin.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Ladies and gentleman, at  
9 this time, please place all electronic devices, all  
10 electronic devices, to vibrate. Thank you for your  
11 cooperation. Madam Majority Leader?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Good afternoon and  
13 welcome to the Stated Meeting of December 9<sup>th</sup>, 2021.  
14 I am Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo, and I'd like to  
15 thank you for joining us. If you'd like to follow  
16 along, the agenda for today's meeting is posted on  
17 our website.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Please join us for the  
19 Pledge Allegiance.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: I pledge allegiance to  
22 the flag of the United States of America and to the  
23 Republic for which it stands, one nation under God,  
24 indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Roll call.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 5  
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?  
3 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.  
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.  
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?  
7 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.  
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?  
9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present. Blessed  
10 and present.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brannan?  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Present.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers? Cabán?  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Present.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera? Carr? Chin?  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Present.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Presente.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Darma Diaz?  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Present.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Ruben Diaz?  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Presente.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Dinowitz?  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Present  
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 6  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Present.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Feliz?  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Presente.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro?  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj? Grodenchik?  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo? Koslowitz?  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Koslowitz?  
20 Lander?  
21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.  
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?  
23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.  
24 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?  
25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 7  
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Louis?  
3 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present.  
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel? Menchaca?  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.  
6 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller? Moya? Perkins?  
7 Powers?  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Present.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso? Riley?  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Present.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose?  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich? Vallone?  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.  
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 8

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Vernikov? Yeger?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli? Cumbo?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Here.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much.

10 We will now have today's invocation which will be  
11 delivered by the Reverend Paul Daniels, Spiritual  
12 Leader at the Cathedral of Saint John the Divine  
13 located at 1047 Amsterdam Avenue and Manhattan. We  
14 welcome you.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All stand. Please  
16 Rise.

17 REVEREND PAUL DANIELS: Let us pray. Oh  
18 God of Life in whom we live, move and have our being.  
19 We stand before your singular truth and justice as  
20 mere mortals. Often indeed we seek after the right,  
21 the good, the light, and often indeed we fail. And  
22 so we stand before your singular truth and justice  
23 with ready hearts and minds that know the right, the  
24 good, and the light, come through the power of your  
25 free grace and love alone. Give to all gathered here



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 9  
2 today the wisdom of humility, the spirit of justice,  
3 and a hunger for your singular truth and justice.  
4 May the eyes of our leaders in this city be turned to  
5 the suffering of its people, their hearts attuned to  
6 empathy, and their minds fixed on the transformation  
7 of pestilence into power, poverty into plenty, and  
8 justice into peace. In your one holy and gracious  
9 name we pray, amen.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much  
11 Reverend Paul Daniels. We so appreciate your  
12 presence here today. If you would hold for one  
13 moment, because I would now like to ask Council  
14 Member Mark Levine to spread the invocation onto the  
15 record and to let us know a little bit more about how  
16 he knows you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam  
18 Majority Leader, and most of all, thank you Reverend  
19 Paul Daniels for your presence here today, for your  
20 inspirational words. I have the honor to represent  
21 your home base, the Cathedral of Saint John the  
22 Divine in New York City in the heart of Morningside  
23 Heights, and I want to share with everyone that you  
24 are currently an assistant clergy member there at the  
25 Cathedral. You grew up in Raleigh, North Carolina.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 10

2 Reverend Daniels was a parishioner of Saint Ambrose

3 Episcopal Church and was ordained in the Episcopal

4 Church of the Good Shepherd in Raleigh, North

5 Carolina on December 12<sup>th</sup>, 2020. The Reverend

6 Daniels holds a Bachelor of Arts in Philosophy from

7 Morehouse College. He then became a fellow at the

8 Global Partnerships of the Episcopal Church for two

9 years in Grahamstown, South Africa. This was

10 followed by the Reverend Daniels pursuing a Masters

11 of Divinity from Yale University. Reverend Daniels

12 has been influenced by the writings of Howard

13 Thurman, a renowned scholar who was involved in the

14 Civil Rights movement and served as a mentor to the

15 Reverend Doctor Martin Luther King. Reverend Daniels

16 is currently pursuing a PHD in Systematic Theology at

17 Fordham University and his research interest live at

18 the intersections of Black Theology, Christian

19 Mysticism, and Black Critical Philosophy. For fun he

20 loves to read, take long walks, and he enjoys

21 cooking. Thank you again Reverend Daniels for your

22 service to our community and for your presence here

23 today. Thank you. Back to you, Matt. Do I need to

24 say the official wording? Yes, I do. I would like

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 11  
2 to make a motion for unanimous consent to spread the  
3 invocation in full upon the record.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much  
5 Council Member Levine and to Reverend Daniels.  
6 Aren't you glad you stood around to hear your  
7 accolades? And I also want to note that you also  
8 have a Spellman [sic] sister here in Council Member  
9 Adrienne Adams. We thank you so much for being here,  
10 and we thank you for sharing your energy and your  
11 talent and your prayer with us today. Thank you so  
12 much. Thank you so much Council Member Levine. We  
13 will now have the adoption of minutes by Council  
14 Member Mark Treyger.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I make a motion  
16 that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of November  
17 10<sup>th</sup>, 2021 be adopted as printed.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Messages and papers  
19 from the Mayor.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Communication from  
22 City, County, and Borough Offices?

23 COUNCIL CLERK: M349 Certification of  
24 Election of Tiffany Cabán, new Council Member 22<sup>nd</sup>  
25 District.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 12

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,  
3 printed, and filed, and I want to congratulate  
4 Council Member Tiffany Cabán for joining us today at  
5 the first Stated Meeting of the City Council.  
6 Congratulations, Council Member Cabán. Welcome.  
7 Very happy to have you here.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: M350 Certification of  
9 election of Inna Vernikov, new Council Member 48<sup>th</sup>  
10 District.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,  
12 printed, and filed, and we want to welcome Council  
13 Member Inna Vernikov to her first Stated Meeting of  
14 the New York City Council. Congratulations, Council  
15 Member.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: M-- excuse me. M351,  
17 certification of election of David M. Carr, new  
18 Council Member 50<sup>th</sup> District.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,  
20 printed, and filed, and I'm really, really happy to  
21 congratulate someone I've known a long time, Council  
22 Member David Carr, his election to the New York City  
23 Council. Welcome, Council Member Carr, to your first  
24 Stated Meeting of the New York City Council.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 13  
2 COUNCIL CLERK: M352 Certification of  
3 November 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2021, General Election for City Council  
4 Members.  
5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,  
6 printed, and filed.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: M353 New York City's debt  
8 incurring power.  
9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,  
10 printed, and filed.  
11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Petitions and  
12 communications.  
13 COUNCIL CLERK: M354 and 355 Resignation  
14 of Steven Matteo as Minority Leader, and appointment  
15 of Joseph C. Borelli as new Minority Leader.  
16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,  
17 printed, and filed. And congratulations to my  
18 friend, Minority Leader Joe Borelli.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: M356 Resignation of  
20 Steven Matteo as Council Member 50<sup>th</sup> District.  
21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,  
22 printed, and filed. We're going to miss Steve. He's  
23 a great guy.  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Land Use Call-ups.  
25 COUNCIL CLERK: M357.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 14

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I'm going to ask that  
3 the clerk take a roll call vote on today's Land Use  
4 Call-ups. Remember, members who are both here online  
5 and in-person, we are just at this moment voting on  
6 Land Use Call-ups. So, clerk, if you could take the  
7 role.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye on all.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Adams  
11 votes aye on all. Ampry-Samuel?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ampry-  
14 Samuel votes aye. Ayala?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ayala  
17 votes aye. Barron?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brannan?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Present

23 [sic].

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabán?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Aye.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 15

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Cabán

3 votes aye. Cabrera? Carr?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Aye.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Carr votes

6 aye. Chin?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Chin votes

9 aye. Cornegy?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Darma Diaz?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Darma Diaz

14 votes aye. Ruben Diaz?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Si.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Dinowitz?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Council Member

18 Dinowitz vote aye. Dromm?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Dromm vote

21 aye. Eugene?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Feliz?

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Aye on all.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: I vote aye.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 16  
2 UNIDENTIFIED: [speaking Spanish]  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Gracias. Gennaro?  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Aye.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gibson?  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Vote aye.  
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gjonaj?  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.  
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Gjonaj  
10 votes aye. Grodenchik?  
11 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Yes.  
12 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Grodenchik  
13 votes yes. Holden?  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.  
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Holden  
16 votes aye. Kallos?  
17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.  
18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Kallos  
19 vote aye. Koo?  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.  
21 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Koslowitz?  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Koslowitz  
24 votes aye. Lander?  
25 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 17  
2 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Lander  
3 votes aye. Levin?  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Levin  
6 votes aye. Levine?  
7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.  
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Levine  
9 votes aye. Louis?  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye on all.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Louis  
12 votes aye. Maisel?  
13 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.  
14 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Maisel  
15 votes yes. Menchaca?  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Menchaca  
18 votes aye. Miller? Council Member Miller? Moya?  
19 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.  
20 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Perkins?  
21 Powers?  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye.  
23 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Reynoso?  
24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye.  
25 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Riley?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 18  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: I vote aye.  
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rivera?  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.  
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Rivera  
6 votes aye. Rodriguez?  
7 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.  
8 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Rodriguez  
9 votes aye. Rose?  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.  
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Rose votes  
12 aye. Rosenthal?  
13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.  
14 COUNCIL CLERK: COUNCIL MEMBER Rosenthal  
15 votes aye. Salamanca?  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote aye.  
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Treyger?  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.  
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Ulrich?  
20 Vallone?  
21 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.  
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Van Bramer?  
23 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.  
24 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Van Bramer  
25 votes aye on all. Vernikov?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 19

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: I vote aye.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Vernikov votes aye on  
4 all. Thank you. Yeger?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Yeger  
7 votes aye. Council Member Brooks-Powers on Land Use  
8 Call-ups?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers votes aye.  
11 Thank you. Borelli?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Borelli  
14 votes aye. Cumbo?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Aye.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Today's Land Use  
19 Call-ups have a vote of 47 in the affirmative and  
20 zero negative.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Council Member Gjonaj?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We will now have  
23 communication from Speaker Corey Johnson.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Good afternoon. Happy  
25 Thursday. Welcome to today's Stated Meeting. We

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 20  
2 have a very busy agenda ahead of us today, but before  
3 we delve into the agenda, I'd like to remind all  
4 members that masks are required to be worn throughout  
5 the Stated Meeting, even while speaking. Today, we  
6 are voting on 29 bills and a resolution to help us  
7 tackle some of the issue we face as a city, including  
8 a bill to allow non-citizen New Yorkers to vote in  
9 municipal elections. While across our nation voting  
10 participation is being challenged, here in New York  
11 City we are expanding it. Our city will become the  
12 largest municipality in the nation that will allow  
13 non-citizens to vote in local elections. This  
14 afternoon we're voting on several bills regarding  
15 traffic safety measures, another one allowing the  
16 Civilian Complaint Review Board to initiate its own  
17 complaints against members of the NYPD where alleged  
18 misconduct has occurred. Before we go any further,  
19 we just did it, but it's important to do it again. I  
20 want to extend a special welcome to our newest  
21 Council Members, Council Member Tiffany Cabán,  
22 Council Member Inna Vernikov, and Council Member  
23 David Carr. They were sworn in last week, and today  
24 they are taking part in their first Stated Meeting.  
25 Council Member Cabán represents District 22 in

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 21  
2 Queens. Council Member Vernikov represents District  
3 48 in Brooklyn, and Council Member Carr represents  
4 District 50 in Staten Island. Congratulations again  
5 to all three of you. We are really grateful that you  
6 are here today. Welcome. As we head into the winter  
7 months, I want to ask everyone to remain vigilant as  
8 we continue to battle COVID-19, especially in light  
9 of the new variant. Omicron has arrived in New York  
10 City. As with any of the previous variants, it  
11 brings concern and worry. We must recommit ourselves  
12 to ensuring we do all we can to fight this pandemic.  
13 As of December 8<sup>th</sup> we have lost 34,925 New Yorkers to  
14 COVID-19. It is critical that we keep wearing masks  
15 in public spaces, stay home if you feel sick, and to  
16 get vaccinated if you haven't already, and if you are  
17 vaccinated, please get your booster shot. As I do at  
18 every Stated Meeting, I'd like to a moment to  
19 acknowledge some of the losses we have endured as a  
20 city, Alvin Suriel Assistant Chief of FDNY EMS died  
21 on Tuesday, December 7<sup>th</sup>. He became the 264<sup>th</sup> member  
22 of the FDNY to succumb to an illness related to the  
23 9/11 terrorist attack. He was a 32-year veteran of  
24 the New York City Emergency Medical Service  
25 Department, and he was only 52 years old. On

1                   NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING           22  
2   December 3<sup>rd</sup> we lost probationary fire fighter  
3   Vincent Malvo [sp?]. He was at the FDNY training  
4   academy when he suffered a medical emergency.  
5   Probationary fire fighters Malvo was rushed to Harlem  
6   Hospital where he sadly died. He was only 31 years  
7   old. On November 26<sup>th</sup> we lost Stephen Sondheim, a  
8   Broadway legend who transformed the American stage  
9   musical. Born in Manhattan, Sondheim wrote the  
10   lyrics for Westside Story and Gypsy. During the 70s  
11   and 80s he created musicals such as Sweeney Todd,  
12   Company, which I saw the other day-- it was fabulous--  
13   - Follies, and Into the Woods. Sondheim wrote the  
14   music and the lyrics for more than a dozen Broadway  
15   shows. He was 91 years old. We also lost a member of  
16   our Council family. We mourn the death of Retired  
17   Sergeant at Arms Gerry Steffarie [sp?]. Gerry was an  
18   exemplary worker and retired from the Council in  
19   2012. He is survived by his two daughters Julianne  
20   and Diana and his five grandchildren. If we could  
21   all rise and have a moment of silence for everyone  
22   that we have lost.

23                   [moment of silence]

24                   SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. Okay, now  
25   jumping into our docket for the day. The Council

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 23  
2 will be voting on the following Finance items,  
3 Introduction 1520A, sponsored by Council Member and  
4 Finance Chair Danny Dromm, will require the  
5 Department of Finance to report on the operations of  
6 the Parking Violations Bureau. Introduction number  
7 2458, sponsored by Council Member Dromm, would  
8 authorize the Lowe East Side bid and the Hudson Yards  
9 bid to increase their annual assessments. We have a  
10 transparency resolution and five affordable housing  
11 property tax exemptions, Hong Ning Senior Housing in  
12 Council Member Margaret Chin's district, Johanna One  
13 in Council Member Bill Perkins' district, 250 West  
14 HDFC in Council Member Perkins' district, 1018 East  
15 163<sup>rd</sup> Street in Council Member Rafael Salamanca's  
16 district, and Seaview Estates in Council Member  
17 Debbie Rose's district. The Council will be voting  
18 on the following Land Use items: Citywide hotels text  
19 amendment as modified would establish a special  
20 permit for new hotels and for enlargements where  
21 hotels are permitted as-of-right. The Council will  
22 modify the vesting provisions for vacant sites in the  
23 Theater District. Also included are the site  
24 selections of a 572-seat primary school in Council  
25 Member Paul Vallone's district, a 576-seat primary

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 24  
2 school in Council Member David Carr's district, an  
3 801-seat high school in Council Member Daneek  
4 Miller's district, a new supportive space for the  
5 Hungerford School in Council Member Debbie Rose's  
6 district. Also in Council Member Rose's district,  
7 Stapleton Beacon Article 11 disposition which will  
8 facilitate the construction of 359 affordable units.  
9 Starrett-Lehigh High in terminal warehouse building  
10 rezoning in my district as modified will expand the  
11 special West Chelsea district and will facilitate the  
12 adaptive reuse of these existing buildings. Our  
13 modification will be to reduce the floor area allowed  
14 for large retail use. 506<sup>th</sup> Third Avenue as modified  
15 will facilitate a five-story commercial development  
16 and commercial enlargement at a nearby property in  
17 Council Member Brad Landers' district, and the  
18 Council will modify the MIH options. Bed-Stuy East  
19 and Weeksville Mosaic UDAP and Article 11 tax  
20 exemption to facilitate the development of 46  
21 affordable cooperative home ownership units in  
22 Council Member Robert Cornegy and Alicka Ampry-  
23 Samuels districts. One White Avenue industrial  
24 business incentive area will facilitate the  
25 development of a new eight-story commercial and



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 25  
2 industrial building in Council Member Steve Levin's  
3 district. 40-20 83<sup>rd</sup> Street rezoning will facilitate  
4 a new nine-story residential building with 163 units,  
5 up to 49 permanently affordable in Council Member  
6 Danny Dromm's district. Beach [sic] 79<sup>th</sup> Self-  
7 Storage in Council Member Selvena Brooks-Powers'  
8 district. 31<sup>st</sup> Street and Haight [sp?] Avenue  
9 rezoning will facilitate three new mixed-use  
10 buildings with approximately 287 dwelling units, 69  
11 of which will be affordable in Council Member Tiffany  
12 Cabán's district. And finally, we'll be voting on  
13 the withdrawal of the New York City Law Department  
14 office lease from our calendar. Moving on to our  
15 legislative agenda. I'll be brief since we have a  
16 lot to get through today. Introduction Number 2141A  
17 sponsored by Council Member Carlina Rivera will  
18 remove references to clinically outdated and  
19 stigmatizing terms once used to refer to disabilities  
20 in our laws, and instead use intellectual disability  
21 or intellectual and developmental disability. I want  
22 to thank Sarah Lisk [sp?] from the staff. Also out  
23 of the Committee on Mental Health, Disabilities and  
24 Addiction, we're voting on Introduction 2442A  
25 sponsored by Council Member Diana Ayala who is also

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 26  
2 the Chair of the Committee. This bill will require  
3 the Mayor to establish an Office of Community Mental  
4 Health within the Executive Office of the Mayor, and  
5 again, I want to thank Sarah Lisk. From the  
6 Committee on Health, Introduction number 1625  
7 sponsored by-- 1625B sponsored by Council Member  
8 Carlina Rivera, will require the Department of Health  
9 and Mental Hygiene to make different forms of  
10 nonsurgical contraception available at city health  
11 sites. I want to thank Harboni Ahujah [sp?]. Our  
12 next bill in Introduction Number 1621A sponsored by  
13 Council Member Danny Dromm, and out of the Committee  
14 on Governmental Operations, this bill will establish  
15 a committee to examine the City's position on nuclear  
16 disarmament, and this is related to recognizing the  
17 City as a nuclear weapons-free zone. I want to thank  
18 CJ Murray. Related to that bill we have Resolution  
19 976A also sponsored by Council Member Dromm out of  
20 the Committee on Civil Service and Labor calling on  
21 the Comptroller to instruct our pension funds to  
22 divest from companies involved in the production and  
23 maintenance of nuclear weapons. I want to thank  
24 Elizabeth Arzt from the Committee on Governmental  
25 Operations. We also have Introduction Number 2459A

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 27  
2 sponsored by Council Member Oswald Feliz. This bill  
3 will make the Mayor's Office of Information Privacy a  
4 charter-mandated office. I want to thank CJ Murray.  
5 Today we have two bills from the Kimeon [sic]  
6 veterans, Introduction Number 2354A sponsored by  
7 Council Member Eric Dinowitz, the Chair of the  
8 Committee, will expand the Veterans Advisory Board  
9 from 11 members to 13 members. The second bill from  
10 the Committee on Veterans is Introduction Number 479A  
11 sponsored by Council Member Danny Dromm. This bill  
12 will extend all city benefits and services to  
13 veterans who have bad discharge papers due to their  
14 sexual orientation or gender identity or expression.  
15 From the staff I want to thank Bianca Vitale for  
16 those two bills. Moving on. Out of the Committee on  
17 Contracts, Introduction Number 1624A sponsored by  
18 Council Member Ben Kallos will expand the data  
19 included in the City's Minority and Women's Business  
20 Enterprise quarterly report in order to provide  
21 additional information on enterprise vendors. From  
22 the staff I want to thank Alex Paulenoff and Leah  
23 Skrzypiec. We also have Introduction Number 2130A  
24 sponsored by Council Member Helen Rosenthal out of  
25 the Committee on Consumer Affairs. This bill will

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 28

2 help connect New Yorker's information on student loan

3 forgiveness, and from the staff I want to thank

4 Stephanie Jones, Leah Skrzypiec and Noah Meixler.

5 Next up we have two bills from the Committee on Women

6 and Gender Equity. First, Introduction Number 1085B,

7 sponsored by Council Member Mark Treyger, will

8 establish a two-year long pilot program to provide

9 legal representation and domestic violence survivors

10 in divorce proceedings. And second, Introduction

11 2372B, sponsored by Council Member Carlina Rivera,

12 will extend the statute of limitations for a civil

13 action alleging a gender-motivated act of violence

14 from seven years to nine years. And from the staff I

15 want to thank Smita Deshmukh for those two bills.

16 Out of the Committee on Civil Service and Labor and

17 sponsored by its Chair, Council Member Daneek Miller,

18 we have Introduction Number 2454. This bill will

19 meliorate the free rider effect by removing certain

20 benefits that public sector unions are required to

21 provide to non-members. From the staff I want to

22 thank Bianca Vitale. We have one bill from our

23 Committee on Housing and Buildings, Introduction

24 Number 2309A, sponsored by Council Member Ben Kallos,

25 will require applicants seeking to rent out rooms in

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 29  
2 a Class A dwelling unit for fewer than 30 consecutive  
3 days as short term rentals to register with the  
4 Mayor's Office of Special Enforcement and obtain a  
5 registration number before being permitted to rent  
6 out rooms. Booking services will be required to  
7 verify the short term rental registration number for  
8 any accommodation before listing it on their service.  
9 And from the staff I want to thank Louis Cholden-  
10 Brown. Moving on and out of the Committee on General  
11 Welfare, we also have two other bills. First up,  
12 Introduction Number 147B, sponsored by Council Member  
13 Steve Levin who is the Chair of the Committee, and it  
14 will provide transparency around which clients are  
15 selected or ejected for supportive housing. The  
16 second bill, Introduction 2176A, also sponsored by  
17 Chair Levin. This bill will require the Department  
18 of Social Services to create a written notice for  
19 supportive housing residents of their rights pursuant  
20 to various state and local laws. From the staff I  
21 want to thank Aminta Kilawan. We got it done, Steve.  
22 Next, we have three bills from the Committee on  
23 Environmental Protection. First, Introduction Number  
24 2425A sponsored by Rafael Salamanca, and it will  
25 require the Department of Environmental Protection to

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 30  
2 assign Borough Commissioners. From the staff I want  
3 to thank Samara Swanston and Kris Sartori. Next,  
4 Introduction 2460A, sponsored by Council Member James  
5 Gennaro, will authorize the New York City Mayors  
6 Office of Environmental Protection-- of Environmental  
7 Remediation, excuse me, the authority to issue civil  
8 penalties against parties who violate program  
9 requirements. From the staff, again, Samara Swanston  
10 and Kris Sartori. Introduction Number 51A, sponsored  
11 by Council Member Bill Perkins, will require a study  
12 on the installation of geothermal energy systems on  
13 government-owned sites. Again, Samara and Kris. And  
14 next, we're voting on Introduction Number 2366A from  
15 the Committee on Parks and Recreation, sponsored by  
16 the Chair of that committee, Council Member Peter  
17 Koo. It will require the Department of Parks and  
18 Recreation to conduct risk and health inspections of  
19 street trees, and I want to thank Kris Sartori and  
20 Patrick Mulvihill. Moving on, from the Committee on  
21 Fire and Emergency Management, we have Introduction  
22 Number 1949A sponsored by Majority Leader Laurie  
23 Cumbo. This bill will require New York City  
24 Emergency Management to ensure the periodic review of  
25 all citywide emergency plans coordinated by the

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 31  
2 Department, and I want to thank Joshua Kingsley and  
3 William Hungatch [sp?]. Next up we're voting on four  
4 bills out of the Committee on Transportation,  
5 Introduction Number 2417A sponsored by Council Member  
6 Bob Holden, and it'll prohibit the sale or  
7 distribution of products designed to conceal or  
8 obscure license plates. I want to thank Jessica  
9 Steinberg Alpin [sp?]. This afternoon we're voting  
10 on Introduction Number 2201A sponsored by Council  
11 Member Carlina Rivera. This bill will permit owners  
12 and operators of motorcycles to digitally provide  
13 photographic evidence that parking was paid for at  
14 the time of an alleged parking violation. Again, I  
15 want to thank Jessica. Introduction Number 9A,  
16 sponsored by Council Member Inez Barron, will require  
17 the Department of Transportation to install traffic  
18 control devices at intersections near schools.  
19 Again, I want to thank Jessica. And to improve  
20 traffic safety, the last bill we're voting on is  
21 Introduction Number 1724A, sponsored by Council  
22 Member Ben Kallos. This bill will authorize the  
23 creation of a program for installing and operating  
24 cameras on school bus arms, school bus stop arms,  
25 that are capable of photographing drivers who

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 32  
2 illegally pass a school bus, and I want to thank  
3 Elliott Lynn. From the Committee on Public Safety,  
4 we have two bills. First, Introduction Number 2297A,  
5 sponsored by Council Member Francisco Moya. This  
6 bill prohibits the NYPD from hiring cops that have  
7 been fired for misconduct. The second bill is  
8 Introduction Number 2440A sponsored by Council Member  
9 Adrienne Adams, who is the Chair of our Committee on  
10 Public Safety. Currently, the Civilian Complaint  
11 Review Board is largely limited to conducting  
12 investigations of police misconduct in response to  
13 complaints filed by members of the public. This bill  
14 will give the CCRB the power to initiate its own  
15 complaints against members of the NYPD that allege  
16 misconduct involving excessive use of force, bias-  
17 based policing and racial profiling, discourtesy or  
18 offensive language. And from the staff, for these  
19 two bills, I want to thank Joshua Kingsley. The  
20 right to vote is fundamental to a modern functioning  
21 democracy. Today, we are making history here in  
22 these chambers by expanding the right to vote to more  
23 than 800,000 immigrant New Yorkers who have not yet  
24 attained US citizenship. New York has been built by  
25 immigrants, and we are what we are today because of



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 33

2 them. I am proud to voting on legislation that will

3 give the right to vote to green card holders and

4 people who are authorized to work in the United

5 States of America. Immigrants pay taxes. They use

6 city services. Their kids go to our public schools.

7 They are part of our community, and they deserve a

8 say in local government. Out of the Committee on

9 Governmental Operations, Introduction Number 1867,

10 sponsored by my friend Council Member Ydanis

11 Rodriguez who has worked so hard on this for so long.

12 We'll get this bill across the finish line and will

13 create a new system of non-citizen voting in New York

14 City. a non-citizen New Yorker will be eligible to

15 vote under this bill if they are either a lawful

16 permanent resident or authorized to work in the

17 United States, have been a resident of New York City

18 for at least 30 consecutive days, and meet all the

19 qualifications for registering to vote under the New

20 York State Election Law, other than US citizenship.

21 Any person who satisfied these criteria will be able

22 to register as a municipal voter with the New York

23 City Board of Elections. Once registered, they'll be

24 able to vote in any primary, general, or special

25 election for Mayor, Comptroller, Public Advocate,

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 34  
2 Borough President, or City Council Member. They will  
3 also be able to vote on any local ballot initiatives.  
4 And from the staff I want to thank Jackie Bazillis  
5 [sp?] and CJ Murray [sp?]. That is our very long  
6 agenda today, Madam Majority Leader. I want to thank  
7 you for presiding as always, and I turn it back to  
8 you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Speaker  
10 Johnson. We will now move into discussion of General  
11 Orders. I'd like to first recognize Council Member  
12 Gennaro.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you, Madam  
14 Leader. I'll be brief in lieu of the long agenda.  
15 Speaking on my bill, Intro 2460A. On Earth Day in  
16 2009 the City Council passed Local Law 27 known as  
17 the New York City Brownfield and Community  
18 Revitalization Act, which I sponsored, that created  
19 the only municipal Brownsfield Cleaning Program in  
20 the United States. We created that program because  
21 80 percent of New York City Brownfield sites do not  
22 qualify for the New York State Brownfields program,  
23 and since the program started in 2010, 750 projects  
24 have been cleaned. More than 1,600 units of  
25 affordable housing have been built, and businesses of

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 35  
2 all kinds have been opened. Most of the projects  
3 have been done in communities that have suffered the  
4 most environmental injustice. Whenever some  
5 developers have, you know, taken liberty with the  
6 program. The city needs an enforcement mechanism in  
7 the form of civil penalties to make sure all  
8 participants in the program [inaudible] fully, and  
9 thereby maintain the integrity of the City  
10 Brownsfield Clean-up Program. This bill gets that  
11 done. I'd like to thank in a special way Speaker  
12 Johnson, Jason Goldman, Jeff Baker, Samara Swanston,  
13 Kris Sartori, my Legislative Director [inaudible] and  
14 Mark McIntyre [sp?] from the Administration who is  
15 the Director of the Office of Environmental  
16 Remediation who worked on this with me back in 2009.  
17 He's still there. He heads that program. I want to  
18 thank him for this partnership, and thank you Madam  
19 Leader.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. We'll  
21 now have Council Member Ben Kallos.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I've been a  
23 tenant most of my life and I'm tired of having to  
24 compete with tourists for housing in our city.  
25 Housing should be for New Yorkers. Hotels should be

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 36  
2 tourists, for tourists. It's as simple as that.  
3 There were 37,000 units on AirBnB and 20,000 of them  
4 are currently listed as entire homes, which is not  
5 allowed in buildings with three or more units under  
6 state law. There are many bad actors out there, like  
7 one who rented apartments across 35 different  
8 buildings to tens of thousands of guests for over  
9 55,441 nights. That's more than a century of housing  
10 kept off the market. It is possible that many hosts  
11 don't even know that what they're doing is illegal.  
12 Today we are voting to pass a law to require every  
13 host to register their units and every platform to  
14 register with the City. Through the registration  
15 process, hosts will learn whether it is legal to rent  
16 their units. Units that are rent-regulated, city  
17 subsidized, affordable housing, or a NYCHA public  
18 housing won't be allowed. Market-rate rentals would  
19 be able to register and list their units. Property  
20 owners would get notice when this happens.  
21 Cooperatives, condominiums, and building owners will  
22 be able to opt out of any having any units listed.  
23 Single family homeowners would be free to register  
24 and list a spare room. By passing this legislation  
25 we actively respond to New York City's affordable

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 37  
2 housing crisis a little better by hopefully bringing  
3 as many as 20,000 apartments back onto the market,  
4 many of which might even be affordable. This morning  
5 we had 45,780 people wake up at our shelters, 14,773  
6 of them were children, 11,168 adults as part of 8,500  
7 families. We could end family homeless with just  
8 half the units that are coming back. With only  
9 16,714 single adults in the shelter system we could  
10 house every homeless New Yorker in these soon to be  
11 vacant Airbnb units. I'd like to conclude by  
12 thanking Mike McKee [sp?] and Tenants Pact, the  
13 Coalition Against Illegal Hotels and it's working  
14 group, in particular Tom Caylor [sp?] and Mary Cox  
15 [sp?]. Many colleagues who have been provided  
16 insight into this legislation including to but not  
17 limited to Senator Liz Kruger and Council Member  
18 Carlina Rivera. My counsel Wilfredo Lopez and Louis  
19 Cholden-Brown, we couldn't have done it without you.  
20 Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Council  
22 Member Kallos. We'll now have Council Member Koo.  
23 Council Member Koo?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yes, I'm here.  
25 Thank you, Majority Leader. Today I ask my

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 38  
2 colleagues to join me in supporting Intro 2366A, a  
3 bill that takes a huge step towards protecting our  
4 city's most important natural resources, our trees.  
5 Too often do our constituents call 311 to report  
6 damaged, unhealthy, and dangerous trees only to watch  
7 them fall during the next severe storm due to the  
8 city's inaction. Intro. 2366A will address this by  
9 requiring the Parks Department to more regularly  
10 conduct risk and health inspections of our street  
11 trees so issues can be found earlier on. It will  
12 also provide more transparency as to how our city's  
13 trees are inspected. More importantly, this bill  
14 will finally give us answers as to what happens to  
15 our 311 complaints. Parks will be required to report  
16 on the number of trees referred for inspection each  
17 year. How many are actually inspected and report on  
18 the results of those inspections? All of this  
19 information will also be maintained on the map posted  
20 on their website. Ultimately, this bill is about  
21 increasing governmental transparency, keeping our  
22 residents safe, and protecting our urban canopy so  
23 that it can be around for generations to come. I  
24 hope you will join me in voting yes on this bill.  
25 Thank you, Kris, Patrick, Chima [sp?], and Monica,

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 39  
2 Bret [inaudible], Jeff Baker, Jason, and Speaker  
3 Johnson, along with my own staff [inaudible]. Thank  
4 you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much  
6 Council Member Koo. We'll now have Council Member  
7 Brooks-Powers.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you  
9 and good afternoon. I'd like to convey my support for  
10 Intro. 1625. I'm proud of the Council's efforts to  
11 broaden and protect New Yorker's access to safe and  
12 effective long-term contraception. I would like to  
13 also speak on a bill that I have had the privilege of  
14 introducing with Councilwoman Carlina Rivera, Intro  
15 2372 which will create a two-year look-back window  
16 for the Gender-motivated Violence Act so that cases  
17 where the statute of limitations has expired can be  
18 reopened. Victims of gender-based violence face  
19 enormous pressure to stay silent in the wake of their  
20 abuse. Without support from others they can feel  
21 alone and the pandemic has only exacerbated that  
22 isolation. Our legal system must recognize this  
23 reality. All survivors deserve to have their voices  
24 heard on their terms, but far too often they're  
25 stonewalled by an expired statute of limitations.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 40

2 With this new two-year look-back window, countless  
3 others will finally be able to come forward. Justice  
4 delayed is justice denied. I am so glad to say that  
5 when this Council passes Intro. 2372 today, justice  
6 will be delivered. Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much  
8 Council Member Brooks-Powers. We'll now have Council  
9 Member Mark Gjonaj.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you,  
11 Majority Leader. At this time, I request that we  
12 consider Intro. 1867A as a separate question from the  
13 remainder of the General Orders Calendar.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: It's automatic.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So moved.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you  
17 Majority Leader. Before I begin to make a motion, I  
18 just want to first thank Corey Johnson, our Speaker,  
19 the Council Staff, the Majority Leader and all that  
20 have been very helpful in this process. With that  
21 being said, I wish it wasn't me that was doing this,  
22 because too often when we think of immigration and  
23 immigrant issues, we don't think it's a white issue.  
24 It's an [inaudible] issue. Immigration impacts all  
25 races, all colors, all faiths, but today I stand



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 41  
2 before you to make a motion that hopefully will give  
3 the cover of so many of my colleagues that have  
4 concerns about the current bill in its current form.  
5 I hope they find the strength to be honest with  
6 themselves and do right by their conscious as we  
7 discuss this. This is no way is a motion to defeat  
8 the bill that's being proposed. This is so that we  
9 can make the bill better. And when we think of the  
10 responsibilities of elected officials that we are,  
11 this is the responsible course that we're supposed to  
12 be taking. Irresponsible would be rubber stamping.  
13 Irresponsible would be voting on a bill that you're  
14 not completely informed about. Irresponsible would be  
15 allowing this bill in its current form to have  
16 unintended consequences. On an annual basis we issue  
17 1.1 million green cards. So when we talk about the  
18 bill and those that will have the right and the  
19 privilege to vote, it's not about the 800,000 to a  
20 million that currently call New York City home. This  
21 also in the future will include a potential 1.1  
22 million new green card holders. Mr. Speaker, Madam  
23 Majority Leader, I share with you as a son of  
24 immigrants. My parents immigrated here in 1968, June  
25 12<sup>th</sup>. Twenty-two years later they became American

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 42  
2 citizens. In speaking to my mom yesterday and today  
3 about this bill, she shared with me the pride that  
4 she had, how she went and bought a new dress, how my  
5 father who is no longer with me went and bought a new  
6 suit, took family members as they went through the  
7 process, and it was one of the proudest days in their  
8 lives.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: If I may, my  
11 grandmother--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing]  
13 Please conclude.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: became a citizen  
15 at the age of 80, after living here for 40 years.  
16 And my mother was the interpreter, and when she was  
17 asked questions to allow her this privilege, the  
18 person doing the interview asked, "Do you love this  
19 country enough to fight for it?" And she said yes.  
20 "Do you love it enough to go to war for it?" And my  
21 grandmother said, "I am 80 years old, I don't have  
22 the strength to go to war, but I can make food for  
23 the military that would go to war." And she said it  
24 proudly. She is no longer with me.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 43

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
3 Member.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: At this time, I  
5 make a motion to recommit Intro. 1867A to the  
6 Committee on Government Operations, not to kill the  
7 bill, but hopefully for reconsideration that will  
8 emphasize at a minimum on the 30 days residence  
9 requirement, to make that hopefully something more  
10 acceptable, such as a resident for one year and one  
11 day before they're--

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Council  
13 Member Gjonaj, just to--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: offered this  
15 privilege.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
17 Member Gjonaj.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I just want to talk  
19 about process for a moment, and Madam Majority Leader  
20 [inaudible].

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We're going to have  
22 a moment of pause.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Council Member Gjonaj's  
24 made a motion to recommit. The amendment process is  
25 separate from the motion to recommit. So at first,

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 44  
2 we will debate this motion to recommit. It'll be a  
3 debate on the floor on his motion. Once that is over  
4 with and everyone who wants to speak can speak, then  
5 we'll have a roll call vote on that motion to  
6 recommit. I am voting no on the motion to recommit,  
7 but that is the process where we're at. Is that  
8 correct?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Correct.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: So, is there-- Madam  
11 Majority Leader, is there anyone else who wants to  
12 debate Council Member Gjonaj's motion to recommit?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member  
14 Yeger?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you very  
16 much, Madam. I serve on the Government Operations  
17 Committee as I have for the last four years, and we  
18 heard this bill a number of months ago, and it was  
19 voted out of Committee this week. As members of this  
20 Council know, there was also a letter sent by a  
21 substantial number of the members of this Council, I  
22 think the number exceeds 20, raising several  
23 questions about the bill, not merely questions like I  
24 raised that it's unconstitutional under state law.  
25 It's very clear, and we'll discuss that later. But

1                   NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING                   45  
2           questions about how the bill would operate. For  
3           example, does the Board of Elections have enough  
4           money to do this? Is the Board of Elections prepared  
5           to do this? Questions about how the registration  
6           system would work with respect to the 30 days,  
7           whether 30 days is too short. Should it be longer?  
8           Should it be 60 days? Should it be year? And that  
9           letter having been sent this week, here we are today  
10          and it's still on the floor, and the issue before us  
11          is really just sending it back to the committee. Let  
12          the committee have the bill back so that the  
13          information can be brought into the committee so that  
14          the bill, if necessary, can have a few words changed  
15          to make it either better or perhaps even to beat the  
16          likely court challenge which is going to come from  
17          this. We all know that's happening. So, this is a  
18          very simple bill not-- this is a very simple motion  
19          not to kill the bill, not to beat the bill, not to  
20          vote it down, but to send it back into the other room  
21          where the Governmental Operations Committee can  
22          consider this later this week or next week and have  
23          that conversation. Thank you very much, Madam  
24          President.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 46

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
3 Member Yeger. Council Member-- Speaker Corey  
4 Johnson.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam  
6 Majority Leader. I just want to be clear so folks  
7 understand. If this bill is amended in any way, it  
8 would need to be re-aged and there is not enough re-  
9 aging days between now and the next Stated Meeting of  
10 the City Council, and that Stated Meeting is not  
11 moving for a variety of reasons, which means that the  
12 bill could not come up again before this council  
13 finishes, which means that the bill would die this  
14 year. It would then be kicked to the next council.  
15 The bill would need to be reintroduced, reheard,  
16 sponsors would need to sign onto it again, and it  
17 would go through a full legislative process. So, if  
18 this bill is amended today in any way, the bill is  
19 technically dead for this legislative session and the  
20 next City Council would have to take it up. I wanted  
21 to clarify that so people understand that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you for your  
23 clarity. Council Member Lander? Followed by  
24 Menchaca.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 47  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam  
3 majority Leader. I've been a member of tis City  
4 Council for three terms now, 12 years. In every one  
5 of those terms I've been proud to be a sponsor of  
6 this bill, to extend voting rights to our non-citizen  
7 neighbors. For much of that time, across all three  
8 terms, the bill had a super majority of sponsors. I  
9 looked back. It had a super majority in my first  
10 term in the Council, and it has a super majority  
11 today. There is strong support in this body and in  
12 this city to recognize that our neighbors who pay  
13 taxes, who work hard, who take care of us through  
14 caregiving jobs deserve the right to vote in our  
15 municipal elections. But whether you think that or  
16 don't think that, and respectfully, whether you  
17 believe a court will find that this bill is within  
18 our authority or not within our authority, we have  
19 the opportunity at long last, after more than a  
20 decade, to express this body's support for the well-  
21 supported legally and morally and economically idea  
22 that our non-citizen neighbors should vote in our  
23 municipal elections. And I don't want to have it  
24 said that after three terms of super majority  
25 support, we failed even to vote to consider it.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 48

2 Let's be clear what the Speaker said. Sending this  
3 back to committee where it would be amended or  
4 amending the bill on the floor is killing the bill  
5 this session, and hoping that that next Council, the  
6 fourth in which it would be introduced, would do  
7 better than we do. We have an opportunity to make  
8 history today. Let's do it. Please vote no on this  
9 motion to send the bill back to the committee.  
10 Please vote no if amendments are introduced. Please  
11 vote yes when this bill comes to the floor for a  
12 vote. Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member  
14 Menchaca followed by Council Member Gjonaj, and then  
15 Council Member Chin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Hello. Hi,  
17 everyone. Carlos Menchaca. I have also served here,  
18 not for 12, but for eight years as the Chair of the  
19 Immigration Committee with some incredible members  
20 within the committee that have done so much work in  
21 BMT [sic] and beyond the committee work that we've  
22 done to engage immigrant communities. What we are  
23 talking here, and why I'm saying no to this  
24 amendment, is that we're ready to move forward. It  
25 has taken this long to have discussions about what it



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 49  
2 looks like, and this was often delayed in  
3 conversation because Trump was in power. The idea of  
4 pushing something like this during the reign of  
5 terror of Trump is no longer with us. now we can  
6 work together to ensure that we can build a process  
7 to enfranchise people who are in our neighborhoods,  
8 who have been part of community building, and during  
9 COVID you saw essential workers, immigrants, fight  
10 and work on our behalf to make sure that our economy  
11 and city kept moving. The least we can do is give  
12 them the opportunity to vote. I ask you, and I'm  
13 standing with the Speaker and Lander and so many of  
14 you right now, to vote no on this amendment and any  
15 amendment because it will effectively kill this bill  
16 now. This is our time. This is our city. This is  
17 our vote. Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member  
19 Chin followed by Council Member Gjonaj then Council  
20 Member Borelli.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I've also been on  
22 the City Council. This is my 12<sup>th</sup> year, and I  
23 started advocating for the right for immigrants who  
24 are non-citizen to vote even before I joined the City  
25 Council. This has been a long journey. Council

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 50  
2 Member Gjonaj, why did your parents have to wait so  
3 long to become a citizen? I don't think it's not  
4 because they don't want to. There are a lot of  
5 people, a lot of immigrants from around the world,  
6 and I march and I rally with immigrants from Africa,  
7 from Russia, from Asia. They want representation.  
8 My mother couldn't vote for me because she wasn't a  
9 citizen. She had a green card. She paid tax. There  
10 were a lot of members in the community, especially  
11 senior citizens, that's been going to classes trying  
12 to learn the language. It's not that easy. And the  
13 price for the application has been-- keep going up.  
14 Imagine if you need to take the test in Russian or in  
15 Spanish, or in Chinese, or in Korean, it's not easy  
16 to learn a language, and especially for immigrants  
17 who have to work every day just to support their  
18 family. They want to be citizens. They want to be  
19 able to vote for the President, but at least we have  
20 the opportunity to allow them to vote for the elected  
21 official that's representing them in the city. A lot  
22 of them are very active. They volunteer on campaign.  
23 They come to community meeting, but Election Day they  
24 cannot vote for Mayor, they cannot vote for the City  
25 Council. But this bill will give them that

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 51  
2 opportunity to get involved, but have that right to  
3 vote for their representative, and hopefully that  
4 will encourage the regular citizen who usually don't  
5 vote to get out and vote, and that's what democracy  
6 is all about. And this bill is taxation with  
7 representation. Thank you.

8 [applause]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member  
10 Borelli?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Was Gjonaj ahead  
12 of me, or--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] Yes,  
14 he was.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Can I have my  
16 five minutes?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I'll allow Council  
18 Member Gjonaj and then thank you so much Council  
19 Member Borelli.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you  
21 Majority Leader, and thank you colleague,  
22 Councilwoman Chin for that passionate speech.  
23 Democracy gives us choices. My parents waited. They  
24 chose to wait. What this bill is going to allow a  
25 year from now is someone with a work visa to come in

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 52  
2 and 30 days later be able to vote. That person is a  
3 transient, not a permanent resident, not a  
4 contributor to society and the fabric of New York  
5 City. That person is coming in for the duration of  
6 that job or that project and going back to their home  
7 country or another place of origin. This bill is  
8 allowing-- and I must say this, because one of the  
9 issues that came up was fear of. Wasn't too long ago  
10 that we were all focused on television as we were  
11 hearing about Russian influence in an election, and  
12 we were mortified that that could happen. This bill  
13 in its current form doesn't protect New York City or  
14 make it fairer. It makes it vulnerable to outside  
15 influence, whether that be Russia, China, or any  
16 other nationality that does not share the same  
17 principles in freedom and values that we do as  
18 Americans. So be careful, as my grandmother would  
19 say, what you ask for, because you just may get it.  
20 This bill makes the crown jewel of this country, New  
21 York City, vulnerable. Not today because of the one  
22 million New Yorkers that would benefit from this  
23 right, but based on the 1.1 million green cards that  
24 will be issued each and every year moving forward,  
25 and it doesn't take much to use your imagination to

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 53  
2 figure out how dangerous this bill is for the future  
3 of New York City, for the future of New York.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. Thank  
5 you, Council Member Gjonaj. We now have Council  
6 Member Borelli.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you. I'd  
8 like to speak briefly about the legality of this  
9 considering one of my colleagues and friends did  
10 mention that this would be challenged in court, and  
11 that essentially the court would be determining if  
12 what we do today is actually legally or just. I  
13 think that's reason enough to support this motion to  
14 send it back to the committee. Non-citizen voting  
15 has a long history in New York State. By 1804, state  
16 election law specifically requires citizenship to  
17 vote. In 1827 state election law defines citizenship  
18 unambiguously as citizenship in the United States.  
19 Article II of our State Constitution reads, "Every  
20 citizen shall be entitled to vote at every election  
21 for all officers elected by the people and upon all q  
22 questions submitted to the vote of the people  
23 provided that such citizen is 18 years of age or  
24 over, and it shall have been a resident of this city  
25 and of the county, city, or village for 30 days."

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 54

2 Now, that particular section of the State

3 Constitution was passed in 1938 and was approved by a

4 vote, a referendum of the people. not only was it

5 approved by the people in the referendum in 1938, but

6 it was voted five times since then, in 1943, 1945,

7 1961, '66 and as recently as 1995. The people of the

8 state actually voted to do that. A hundred year

9 definition of citizenship, affirmed by people as

10 uniquely qualified to vote in city elections, not

11 once, not twice, but six times. I'll note that some

12 of my friends and colleagues who support this measure

13 oppose the State Constitutional Convention that could

14 have happened four years ago, the actual appropriate

15 time by which this measure could be brought to light.

16 Furthermore, Article III of the State Constitution

17 defines those counted for redistricting persons as

18 inhabitants, not citizens. Meaning, the State

19 Constitution takes the time to differentiate between

20 times we count people as inhabitants versus times we

21 count people as citizens. We count people as

22 citizens to vote. In 1993 and 1997 and 2003,

23 legislation was introduced in the State Assembly for

24 the constitutional change to allow non-citizen

25 voting. Parallel bills were introduced to limit it

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 55  
2 to municipal elections. I ask you, why would the  
3 State Assembly go through the process of having a  
4 state constitutional change if you didn't have to  
5 have a state constitutional change. It's not easy,  
6 but the truth is you have to. All those bills were  
7 defeated but the mere suggestion that that was what  
8 was required lends to the point that this is not  
9 legal what we are doing. At some point, some will ask  
10 us, what about our School Board elections as we did  
11 between 1968 and 2003. The state constitution address  
12 that. It defines local governments as a county, city,  
13 town or village, period. So it limited itself from  
14 School Board elections. Thank you [inaudible] I  
15 really appreciate that. I know you're in much danger  
16 from my spittle [sic]. All those points in the  
17 school board law specifically addressed the issue of  
18 what elections were covered by the State  
19 Constitution. No matter how much my friend Carlos  
20 doesn't want to hear it, the State Constitution is  
21 clear. Moreover, Article 52 Section A of the State  
22 Education Law specifically allowed each parent who  
23 was a citizen of that state, meaning they  
24 specifically specified a citizen of the state could  
25 vote in election law. Now, again, that gives credit

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 56  
2 to the notion that state law is what determines that.  
3 But that's not all, the State Election Law further is  
4 clear on this issue. Section 5-102 states, "No  
5 person shall register for and vote at any election  
6 unless he is a citizen of the United States." That's  
7 clear, right? That's an actual statute from the  
8 state. Furthermore, Section 23 of the Municipal Home  
9 Rule Law states that a referendum is required, not  
10 optional, for any Local Law that changes the  
11 nominating, electing, or removing an elected officer,  
12 and that's what we're doing. So at the very least, my  
13 point is, if you want to do this, there's no problem  
14 with that as long as you do it the right way. This is  
15 not just an opinion of mine, Joe Borelli, the  
16 Minority Leader, the Republican leader. In 2013 an  
17 Administrative Attorney testified to this body that  
18 non-citizen voting is inconsistent with the State  
19 Constitution would require a citywide referendum. On  
20 9/17 of this year Mayor de Blasio himself, a bonafide  
21 [sic] progressive known to you all, said, "Our Law  
22 Department is very clear. It's not legal for this to  
23 be decided at the city level. I really believe this  
24 has to be decided at the state level." I'm almost  
25 finished, excuse me. Two weeks ago, on New York One,



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 57  
2 the same Democratic Mayor said the same thing. And  
3 finally on September 20<sup>th</sup> of this year, our Chief  
4 Democracy Officer, the person who we presume, his  
5 only job is to make sure every legal voter in this  
6 city has the opportunity to vote, said that the law  
7 could violate the State Constitution. So I urge you  
8 all to vote yes on this motion. Send this back to  
9 committee. Let's talk about these legal issues. If  
10 that happens to not by the case, then I urge you all  
11 to vote no on the bill. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Council  
13 Member Borelli. We'll now have Council Member Van  
14 Bramer followed by Levin and Carr.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you.  
16 So, listening to Council Member Gjonaj, I just want  
17 to say I very much appreciate it, the story of your  
18 grandmother and your parents and your immigrant story  
19 which reminds me that we are all immigrants in this  
20 room and in this city, and either an immigrant or the  
21 son or granddaughter of an immigrant, and while I  
22 share you appreciation and of course your family's  
23 story, I don't share you concern. I think this is  
24 one of the best species of legislation that this  
25 council is poised to pass, and this is a great day

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 58  
2 for democracy in the City of New York. I am not  
3 afraid of too many people having the ability to vote.  
4 I am afraid that too many feel powerless in the very  
5 city that they live and work and raise their family  
6 in. This is the best of who we are, this piece of  
7 legislation is everything that we are about. New  
8 York City is that beacon of hope for the entire  
9 country. We lead. This is how we do it, and I could  
10 not in any good conscience not be for this because I  
11 know my own history. I know that my grandmother  
12 Winnfred [sp?] Cody O'Connor [sp?] came from Ireland,  
13 one of 14 children. I know that they were not  
14 welcomed when they came to this country, and it is  
15 important for all of us to remember that we are all  
16 immigrants. This is a city built by and for  
17 immigrants, and this is such a good day for  
18 democracy, a great day for this New York City  
19 Council, one that I'm incredibly proud to serve in  
20 for the last 12 years and to have been a prime co-  
21 sponsor. So I'll be voting no on this call for an  
22 amendment and any other amendments in honor of my  
23 grandmother, but in honor of everyone's family who  
24 absolutely deserves the franchise in this city.  
25 Thank you.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 59

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
3 Member Van Bramer. We'll now have Council Member  
4 Levin followed by Council Member Carr.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
6 much, Madam Majority Leader. My colleagues, I want  
7 to just speak to you as a proud sponsor of this bill  
8 and I've been a sponsor for these three terms. Just  
9 on a process issue, I just want to make sure that  
10 we're absolutely clear, this bill deserves an up or  
11 down vote today, and there's a super majority of  
12 sponsors on this bill. If it's an up or down vote,  
13 the bill will pass. If we vote in favor of my  
14 colleague, Council Member Gjonaj's amendment, this  
15 bill will be dead for this term as the Speaker said.  
16 This bill will be dead. There's no way that we-- if  
17 we were to vote for this amendment that we could pass  
18 this bill in this term. We would essentially be  
19 precluding ourselves from being able to have that up  
20 or down vote. So, in the interest of transparency in  
21 government, we have had hearings on this bill. We  
22 have had a robust public discussion on this bill.  
23 There's not a member in this room who doesn't know  
24 what this bill does, okay? We have to vote no on  
25 this amendment because this amendment is a subterfuge

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 60  
2 on the legislative process here, because what it  
3 essentially does is it kills the bill, because it  
4 would have to re-age, and we do not have the time in  
5 this session to re-age a bill. The last aging  
6 deadline was the other day. So, I just want to make  
7 that absolutely, abundantly clear. Voting yes on  
8 this amendment is essentially an end-around around  
9 our legislative process, and that's unacceptable to  
10 me as a member of this body. This bill deserves an  
11 up or down vote. Vote no on this amendment. Thank  
12 you, respectfully to my colleague, Council Member  
13 Gjonaj.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
15 Member Levin. Council Member Carr?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you, Madam  
17 Majority Leader. I appreciate it. I want to thank  
18 all of you for welcoming me here today on my first  
19 Stated, in particular Speaker Johnson, Minority  
20 Leader Borelli. I've stood in the back of this  
21 chambers many years as a Chief of Staff, and I'm just  
22 honored to be counted among you. But I want to speak  
23 briefly on the bill and amendment being proposed,  
24 excuse me, the motion to recommit that's been  
25 proposed. To me, the right to vote is inherent to

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 61  
2 citizenship. They cannot be separated from one  
3 another. In order to be able to vote in this  
4 country, in this state, in this city you have to be a  
5 citizen of this country and of the state residing  
6 here in New York City. I won't go into the  
7 legalities. Minority Leader Borelli did it far more  
8 thoroughly than I ever could. I believe in the  
9 spirit of the immigrants who have come to this city  
10 in past generations. I'm the son of an immigrant.  
11 My father came here in 1971. He's still a green card  
12 holder himself. Like Council Member Chin and her  
13 family, he was not able to vote for me this year.  
14 I'm the great grandchild of Italian immigrants to  
15 this city from the turn of the last century. I  
16 absolutely celebrate the contributions that they have  
17 made generationally to this city and to this country.  
18 I value you them deeply. But to me, in order to be  
19 able to cast a vote for who is going to govern us,  
20 you have to have been able to make a commitment to  
21 this country and sworn an oath of allegiance to this  
22 country. To me, that is absolutely essential if  
23 we're going to expand the franchise. And I just  
24 would like to point out as Council Member Gjonaj  
25 alluded in his comments, this bill would not just

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 62  
2 enfranchise green card holders. It would enfranchise  
3 those who are authorized to work in this country.  
4 That includes those who are here on non-immigrant  
5 visas. That includes those who are recipients of  
6 deferred action from US Immigration and customs  
7 enforcement. So to me, if we're going to have a  
8 serious conversation about what the franchise should  
9 be in this city, we should send it back to committee.  
10 Let this committee do its work. Let a future Council  
11 do its work, if that's indeed what is needed. And so  
12 I urge my colleges to vote yes on the motion and no  
13 under the underlying bill if it comes to it. Thank  
14 you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. We now  
16 have Council Member Vernikov, Barron, Cornegy, then  
17 Dromm. Welcome.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Thank you,  
19 Madam Majority Leader. My name is Inna Vernikov. I  
20 represent the 48<sup>th</sup> Council District in Southern  
21 Brooklyn. It is an absolute honor for me to be here  
22 with all of you today, being able to take a vote.  
23 [inaudible] elected Republican I understand that we  
24 will, as well as the newly incoming Council Members,  
25 disagree on many issues. However, I think that civil

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 63  
2 discourse is really the cornerstone of our democracy,  
3 and I look forward to working with all of you and  
4 incoming Council Members, especially on issues that  
5 we can agree on. That being said, I cannot support  
6 this bill, the Intro to 1867A. The right to vote is  
7 a sacred right and belongs squarely to United States  
8 citizens. And I'm not just saying this as a  
9 republican talking point. I myself am an immigrant  
10 who came to this country at 12 years old. Both of my  
11 parents did not speak English. I did not speak  
12 English. My parents had to work two jobs to make  
13 ends meet, and I had to work very hard to obtain  
14 United States citizenship just so that we can vote.  
15 We had to learn English, learn history, pay taxes,  
16 and prove that we have a good moral character. And  
17 on top of that, I'm also an Immigration Attorney, and  
18 I have many clients that I represent who come to this  
19 country both legally and illegally, and I believe  
20 that this is a slap in the face to those immigrants  
21 who worked so hard to obtain United States  
22 citizenship so that they can have a say in our  
23 election process. This is also a slap in the face to  
24 the integrity of our election process. If this bill  
25 passes, there's no way to oversee that the non-

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 64  
2 citizens voting actually pay their taxes and have  
3 good moral character. However, the application for  
4 citizenship, the petition for nationalization, which  
5 I am very familiar with, it's a great system that is  
6 already in place to make sure that those voting are  
7 entitled to that privilege. With that, I'll vote aye  
8 on the motion. Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.  
10 Council Member Barron followed by Council Member  
11 Cornegy and Dromm. Council Member Barron, you may  
12 unmute yourself.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Can  
14 you hear me?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. Thank you  
17 so much. I'm going to be very brief. In terms of the  
18 motion on the floor, I'm voting no on the motion. I  
19 think that the bill that we will vote on after we  
20 discharge this motion, that bill is an important  
21 bill. It's been around, as someone had said, for  
22 close to 12 years. I believe it was first introduced  
23 by Council Member Perkins, and I know that  
24 subsequently my husband, then Assembly Member Charles  
25 Barron, carried the bill and others came behind after



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 65  
2 that, inheriting the bill and carrying it forward.  
3 This is an age that we're living in when so many of  
4 the other elements in our country are looking to  
5 restrict and limit voting rights, voting  
6 opportunities. I think that we've got to make sure  
7 that as people are here-- yes, some people are  
8 concerned that it's only a month, but as they're here  
9 that they be educated as to what's going on and  
10 encouraged to join those of us who do vote, which I  
11 believe only comes to about 20 percent. I'm not sure  
12 the exact number. And we need to also encourage  
13 those who are already registered to vote to come out  
14 and vote. And the last point I want to make on this  
15 point is that the bill as it stands, I believe, won't  
16 affect any elections until perhaps June of 2023. So  
17 we certainly have-- not we individually, but the  
18 Council coming in behind us will certainly have an  
19 opportunity to look at how they might want to refine  
20 the bill or make modifications or amendments to that  
21 bill. Much pri-- much time to have to consider that  
22 before the bill would take effect. Thank you very  
23 much.  
24  
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 66

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much.

3 We now have Council Member Cornegy followed by

4 Council Member Dromm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Madam Majority

6 Leader, I actually defer my time. Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay, we'll now

8 have Council Member Dromm.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you, Madam

10 Majority Leader. I really appreciate the opportunity.

11 I also want to acknowledge Council Member Perkins and

12 Council Member Barron who carried this legislation

13 before I did. I carried it for the first two terms

14 that I was in the New York City Council for eight

15 years, and because when became Finance Chair I asked

16 Ydanis Rodriguez to take it, and I'm so glad that

17 he's going to take it over the finish line today. I

18 want to urge my colleagues to vote against this

19 motion. It is going to table it, as has been said

20 before. This is an attempt to stifle voters and to

21 disenfranchise voters. We have seen these attempts

22 all over the country happening before. If you are a

23 true believer in democracy, you will vote in favor of

24 this. we should be enfranchising voters and making

25 sure that everyone who pays taxes, which is the

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 67  
2 founding principle of this country, no taxation  
3 without representation, and we should be firm in our  
4 support of that basic and fundamental American right.  
5 It is way past time to pass this legislation. We  
6 have had enough discussion. We've had enough attempts  
7 to push it aside, and now is the time to pass this  
8 legislation. Thank you, and I look forward to making  
9 sure that this motion is defeated and that we take  
10 the vote on the overall bill, the legislation that is  
11 before us. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member  
13 Holden? Followed by Vallone.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: This motion is  
15 really to send it back to committee. And it-- so  
16 what's the big deal if it gets to the other council,  
17 the next council? Is it to put a feather in your cap  
18 to send this right and vote on this today? By the  
19 way, at the democratic conference that we had, we had  
20 a number of questions and nobody could answers these  
21 questions. Like how many actual voters will be  
22 voting in these elections? Can the Board of Election  
23 handle this? Can they even handle this without  
24 screwing it up and without giving the wrong forms?  
25 And that will happen, folks. That will happen. And

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 68  
2 again, if you want to become a citizen, you become a  
3 citizen by doing months of study, obviously. You  
4 study the Bill of Rights. You answer 100 questions  
5 to become a citizen. You're an educated voter by  
6 then, hopefully. You're saying with this bill that  
7 we don't really want an educated voter. Somebody  
8 here 30 days, folks, 30 days can vote in our  
9 election, decide who our Mayor, City Council, and  
10 other elected officials could be. Again, I'm not  
11 really that educated. You're not asking them to go  
12 to class. You're not asking them to study New York  
13 City history or the electorate. You're not asking  
14 anything. You're saying you should-- taxation without  
15 representation. Well, guess what, folks? We  
16 represent them. Does anybody turn away somebody  
17 who's not a citizen? Does anybody do that here? We  
18 all represent them, so stop with that. Let's do the  
19 right thing here, and let's take some time. Get the  
20 answers, folks. That's all we're asking. So I  
21 support the motion. Thank you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
23 Member Holden. We'll now have Council Member Vallone,  
24 followed by Council Member Reynoso.  
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 69  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Good afternoon  
3 everyone. Thank you, Madam Majority Leader. You  
4 know, I think there's a single point that some of us  
5 who may be for the bill or oppose the bill that just  
6 can't get past. We all have our immigration stories  
7 and very proud of them and we should be. That's how  
8 we got here. But the bill has a fatal flaw, and when  
9 we brought the questions up about that one flaw,  
10 we've yet to get that answer, and it's not the answer  
11 of bringing up our immigration stories with the right  
12 of those who toiled here so long that the ability to  
13 have a say in local government. No one is saying,  
14 however, that that person should have a right after  
15 just 30 days. And if that point needs to be  
16 reargued, resubmitted, re-figured out by committee or  
17 the next Council, then so it be. Thirty days is not  
18 enough for someone to decide who's going to represent  
19 the greatest city in the world, irrespective of what  
20 country you come from, irrespective of what you  
21 believe on this particular bill. You can be for it  
22 or against it, but nobody is for 30 days, and that's  
23 part of this bill, and that is where I struggle with  
24 this bill. It's not a matter of being pro or against  
25 immigration or pro-voting or against your ability to

1                   NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING           70  
2     have that vote. It's saying is that enough? Is that  
3     what we want to vote on today? To give someone who  
4     is just visiting or someone who's a transient worker  
5     or someone who is just here for 30 days to say, "Yep,  
6     that should be the Mayor. That should be the Borough  
7     President. That should be the Council Member." How  
8     do you even engage those people? We don't even know  
9     how to properly interact in the way to submit an  
10    informed vote. So that's my concern. We mentioned  
11    it at the delegation conference and we've mentioned  
12    it before. And you're not going to get those who re  
13    for or against the bill on its merits together today  
14    on that. But that particular point, and that's the  
15    one that has concerned me from the beginning, the 30-  
16    day requirement, and for that we have to seriously  
17    consider this motion and push it off to the next  
18    calendar. Thank you.

19                   COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Council  
20    Member Vallone. Council Member Reynoso.

21                   COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you, Madam  
22    Majority Leader. It just never fails. When white  
23    power or white men's power is being attacked, what  
24    they would consider being attacked, they stand up and  
25    they fight. They fight to preserve their power and

1                   NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING           71  
2           their influence. And what we're saying today is that  
3           [inaudible]. There are people in this city that  
4           participate in every aspect of this great country in  
5           all positive ways, raising children, sending children  
6           to public schools, riding on our roads, driving on  
7           our roads, and it's about time that they have a say  
8           as to what their representation looks like, and we  
9           have to stop and think about this sea of mostly white  
10          men that have stood up against this bill at this  
11          moment in an effort to preserve their power and  
12          influence, and that is exactly what will happen every  
13          time you challenge power. The faces always look the  
14          same, and it just never fails, and I was hoping that  
15          today we could have seen something different. This  
16          bill will pass today. It will. Maybe make another  
17          effort another time when you reassume power, I guess,  
18          to try to undo what I think is the principle  
19          foundation of democracy which is the right to vote,  
20          specifically if you're paying taxes. So, I encourage  
21          all my colleagues to vote no on this request put  
22          forth by Council Member Gjonaj and to vote no on any  
23          amendments, and vote yes on the bill. Thank you.

24                   COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
25          Member Reynoso. Commission Cornegy?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 72

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you, Madam

3 Majority Leader. I would like to-- as a sponsor of

4 the bill, the original sponsor of the bill, I would

5 like to offer a different perspective. You know, I

6 appreciate and respect everyone's immigrant story.

7 However, my ancestors did not come here as

8 immigrants. We came here as slaves and fought

9 vehemently to be able to be a part of the fabric of

10 America and literally die for the right to vote,

11 blood, sweat, and tears, and are still engaged and

12 embroiled in eroding voter rights acts for

13 communities of color across the country. So it's

14 hard. Again, I am a sponsor, but I'm reminded of the

15 tremendous amount of work that continues for black

16 communities across any eroding impact of our votes in

17 the very districts that we serve in. so, I certainly

18 would like to see this, you know, pulled through and

19 made sure that there are no opportunities for us as

20 people who came here as slaves, and like I said,

21 literally died. We don't lose our place in the ranks

22 through voting. So I mean, listen, I'm an original

23 sponsor, and like Antonio said, it'll probably be

24 passed, but I would be remiss if I didn't remind

25 people that there's one more perspective that we



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 73  
2 haven't talked about, and that is a different kind of  
3 immigrant experience and a different kind of voter  
4 rights that we still are suffering throughout the  
5 country. We all have applauded the work of voter  
6 rights advocates in the south, black women's vote,  
7 and all those kinds of things, and that's not being  
8 heard or represented sometimes, and it's not being  
9 heard or represented in this bill. it may very well  
10 pass, but like I said, I would be remiss if I didn't  
11 offer that perspective of representing a people whose  
12 vote has monumentally been taken for granted and now  
13 has eroded to the place where even the Voter Rights  
14 Act that were put in place to protect our vote and  
15 our voices are being eroded.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
19 Member Cornegy. I-- at this point I'm going to offer  
20 my remarks. This is a very personal issue to me and  
21 it's been very emotional. Council Member Ydanis  
22 Rodriguez is my brother and we have been in a  
23 foxhole, as many of you know, for the last year very  
24 closely working together. There's so many  
25 progressive ideas right now that are on the table in

He  
eventually  
votes in  
favor of the  
legislation.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 74

2 terms of voting rights acts and things that we're

3 going to do to empower communities of color. We've

4 seen that most recently with Rank Choice Voting. In

5 the last Rank Choice Voting Mayoral election, we had

6 an African-American Man, Eric Adams, won the primary

7 night with 30.7 percent of the vote, Maya Wiley with

8 21.4 percent of the vote, and Garcia with 19 percent

9 of the vote. But we saw through a Rank Choice Voting

10 process, Eric Adams wound up winning by 50.4 percent

11 and Garcia by 49.6 percent. So what we're seeing in

12 that is we had an extraordinary experience of Eric

13 Adams and Maya Wiley coming in first and second in a

14 mayoral race in New York City. this was historic,

15 but through a process, had it have been successful,

16 the third place white woman candidate could have beat

17 both the African-American men and the African-

18 American woman through a process called Rank Choice

19 Voting that was supposed to empower black

20 communities, and if it had been successful, it would

21 have done just that. It would have taken out the two

22 winning African-American candidates. We are in a

23 process right now. We just completed a census.

24 Redistricting is happening. Our communities and the

25 composition of our communities are changing, and for

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 75  
2 me, with this particular legislation, I'm concerned  
3 as Council Member Cornegy talked about, where do  
4 African-American voters fit in. And we're not just  
5 talking about some sort of ethnic group. we are  
6 talking about the people for the last century who  
7 have protested, who have been on the front lines, who  
8 have died, who have been lynched, who have given  
9 their lives and shed blood, sweat, and tears as we  
10 saw on the Edmund Pettis Bridge on Bloody Sunday. We  
11 are the people that are fighting for the right for  
12 all people. I want everybody in this room to  
13 recognize that if not for the sacrifice of African-  
14 American people the vast majority of people in this  
15 room would not have the right to vote. You would not  
16 be able to have the right to vote. You would not be  
17 able to hold the seats that many of you hold here if  
18 it had not been for African-Americans. So it's  
19 critical when we're passing all of these progressive  
20 measures of legislation that we recognize the  
21 African-American contribution to making it possible.  
22 This is essentially in many ways-- this is going to--  
23 this particular legislation is going to shift the  
24 power dynamics in New York City in a major way, and  
25 we do not have the numbers or the information to know

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 76  
2 how that is going to impact African-American  
3 communities who have been the most vulnerable in  
4 their existence in New York City. Gentrification has  
5 taken root in our communities. Our businesses have  
6 been taken over. Our homes have been taken over.  
7 Our schools have been co-located. The only thing  
8 that many African-American communities have left are  
9 their black representatives and representation. This  
10 bill, in many of our communities, in areas such as  
11 upper Harlem and otherwise are going to be  
12 dramatically changed. Because we are all black and  
13 brown, because we're all black and brown and other  
14 races doesn't mean that we all share the same values  
15 and principles that we're all going to vote and do  
16 things in the same way. This measure will also  
17 change some districts, Republican to Democratic,  
18 Democratic to Republican. This is going to change  
19 our communities in a major way. And I'll just  
20 conclude by saying, the 30 days-- do you know how  
21 long African-Americans had to fight to no longer be  
22 considered three-fifths of a man? We had to fight so  
23 hard just to be considered a whole person in this  
24 area, and we would then say in many ways that someone  
25 could be here for 30 days. There are different

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 77

2 classifications of a green card. Not all green cards

3 take five to seven years. Some of them you get

4 temporarily immediately, and we are not discussing

5 those temporary green cards at all. So, I think it's

6 important that we continue to have this discussion,

7 and again, as the Majority Leader, I just want to

8 close with saying in this body we should never shy

9 away from wanting to ask questions. We should never

10 shy away from wanting more information. We should

11 never shy away from wanting to be able to make a bill

12 better. We can't continue with the expediency or the

13 fear that we're going to be cancelled if we even are

14 known to have asked for more information or for more

15 questions, or to want to make something better. That

16 culture needs to end in order for us to produce

17 better bills, to be more comprehensive, and to make

18 sure that everybody is included in the bills that we

19 are pushing forward. I've never heard in this one

20 discussion about how the African-American voter is

21 going to be impacted by this bill. This is going to

22 be a great win for the ethnic groups that are going

23 to be the highest number in the City of New York.

24 And so, Ydanis, this is your legacy. This is yours,

25 and this is going to be a huge win numerically for

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 78  
2 the Dominican Republic community, and I applaud you  
3 for that. We're all here to support our ethnic  
4 groups, and we're all here to make sure that we all  
5 win, but I need to know in supporting this, which I  
6 need more time, how are African-Americans going to be  
7 impacted, because that's the community I come from.  
8 I'm clear how the Dominican Republic community will  
9 benefit, but not the African-American community, and  
10 it's only fair that I know that information. Thank  
11 you. Council Member Grodenchik?

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: The mic's not on.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you,  
14 Majority Leader Cumbo, Mr. Speaker, my colleagues. I  
15 want to congratulate Ydanis Rodriguez for this  
16 legislation. I don't necessarily agree with it, but  
17 I've known Ydanis for six years since I entered the  
18 Council. I know he's passionate. I know that Danny  
19 Dromm, my dear friend of many years, is passionate  
20 about this. I got up to speak because race was  
21 injected into this debate today, and I have to tell  
22 you I resent that. I truly resent that. I represent  
23 one of the most diverse districts in the City of New  
24 York. I am a product of New York City. I was born in  
25 the Bronx. I raised in New York City public housing

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 79  
2 in Queens, and I have been blessed to be a public  
3 school graduate here, and a graduate of State  
4 University of New York. And I want to tell you about  
5 my experience. My grandfather came here about this  
6 time in 1903. He was fleeing oppression, and he was  
7 not seen as a white guy in czarist Russia. He was  
8 seen as a Jew, and my grandmother came and they were  
9 married in Margaret Chin's district in 1907, and my  
10 grandparents, the other grandparents came from the  
11 Polish part of the Austrian-Hungary Empire in 1912.  
12 And I'm grateful that they did, because the truth of  
13 the matter is that the rest of family was murdered by  
14 the Nazis [inaudible] their name be obliterated. And  
15 I stand here today in my last few weeks of my public  
16 service career to say that this bill should be  
17 debated on the merits. I have worked, I have  
18 represented a majority, almost majority Asian-  
19 American district. I work with Latinos and blacks and  
20 people from all across the world who came to this  
21 city because they wanted one thing. They wanted  
22 freedom. Just a few more seconds, madam Majority  
23 Leader.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: You can conclude.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 80

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you. So

3 to me, I don't think that you should vote unless

4 you're a citizen, and that's what I've held for a

5 long time, and I respect everybody's opinion here.

6 But I just want people to know my story, that I would

7 not be alive if we were in the other country, because

8 in the other country Jews were viewed as subhuman.

9 Thank you, Ms. Majority Leader.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much.

11 I thank you for sharing your story. Council Member

12 Gennaro followed by Council Member Treyger.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you.

14 Thank you, Madam Majority Leader. I wish to be

15 associated with your good remarks on this bill. I

16 guess I have two things to mention, and this is

17 something that I mentioned to the sponsor of the

18 bill. You know, to me, there's a fundamental

19 unfairness that is introduced when you tell a

20 resident of New York City, a permanent resident, that

21 they now will be bestowed with the privilege of

22 voting for local-- for local government officials,

23 but they don't have the ability to run for those

24 offices. So, we're telling them that you're good

25 enough to vote, but not good enough to hold office.



1                   NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING           81

2    They're good enough to vote for mayor, but not be

3    mayor, and to me that's, you know, kind of like a

4    cast system there. And so I think this is one of the

5    fundamental-- I mean, here we're trying to argue

6    about what's-- what kind of-- you know, debate about

7    what's fair, but you know, to me it's-- that a

8    fundamental unfairness which is built in, if we told

9    somebody that you can vote. You know, you can do

10   that, but you can't, you know,-- you can't run for

11   office. And [inaudible] would say this could be an

12   attempt for people to say, look, we're looking for

13   permanent residents to vote for us, but you don't get

14   chance to like run against us, and that's a problem

15   for me. And also, fundamentally, you know, I and

16   everyone in this body took an oath, an oath, to

17   uphold the Constitution of the State of New York, and

18   this, no matter how you feel about it-- certainly on

19   its face violates the Constitution of the State of

20   New York and voting for this would be a violation of

21   my oath of office to uphold the Constitution of the

22   State of New York. Thank you, Madam Majority Leader.

23                   COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much.

24    We'll now here from Council Member Treyger.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 82  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,  
3 Majority Leader. We've heard quite a bit. I speak as  
4 a proud son of immigrants, grandson of immigrants,  
5 and I want to offer a unique perspective that I have  
6 not heard so far today. When the vote came before  
7 the Council in the last term about the city ID cards,  
8 myself and I believe also Council Member Maisel  
9 abstained, and the reason for that was because I  
10 specific questions about who had access to the  
11 information of the residents that would apply for the  
12 cards, and that was before the election of trump, and  
13 I was told, "Council Member, your questions and your  
14 concerns are being overblown." And later, with the  
15 election of President Trump, that became a major  
16 issue in New York, because they went after that  
17 information. And so I heard someone say earlier that  
18 Trump era is over. I beg to disagree. He no longer  
19 is president, but there are people in power who  
20 absolutely continue that Trump legacy and those Trump  
21 policies, and there are serious questions about the  
22 Board of Elections' capacity. Who will be  
23 responsible to verify paperwork? If residents ask,  
24 "Is my information safe?" Who will be privy to it?  
25 The same Board of Elections that still has people who

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 83  
2 have been dead for years on their roles will be privy  
3 and be responsible to process very sensitive,  
4 important, and critical information. And can any of  
5 us say with a straight face that their information  
6 will not be compromised?

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And I also want  
9 to say for the record-- I also want to say for the  
10 record that as the first Russian-speaking official in  
11 New York City history, according to what I've been  
12 told, when I ask the city to pass a law to require  
13 interpreters for not just Russian-speaking residents,  
14 but other languages, I was told that we didn't have  
15 the authority. I was told that we did not have the  
16 authority to get interpreters at poll sites to assist  
17 voters. So I wanted to offer those perspectives on  
18 the record, Majority Leader. Thank you for the time.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much,  
20 Council Member Treyger. Council Member Cabán?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yeah. Thank you.  
22 Thank you. I was not expecting to speak on my first  
23 day in chambers with y'all, but I feel really, really  
24 strongly about this. When I took office, the first  
25 piece of legislation was this one. I stood on the

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 84

2 steps with all of the advocates and directly-impacted

3 folks earlier this morning and said in full sincerity

4 that there is not one piece of legislation before

5 this body at this moment that does more to expand

6 democracy and to lift up the folks of the people that

7 make this city what it is. Expanding the right to

8 vote for some folks does not in any way diminish or

9 tarnish the right to vote for other folks. Yes, I

10 understand that amongst our communities we have

11 different experiences, different struggles, but what

12 anchors all vulnerable communities, whether you are

13 black, brown, the disability community, whether you

14 are queer, the intersection of any marginalized

15 identity that these systems were not made for, what

16 anchors us in those struggles are so common and the

17 same, and it is really divisive to say that our power

18 as one specific community would be watered down by

19 extending the right to allow other voices into our

20 halls of power. This is about making sure that every

21 single person in our city that contributes to our way

22 of life and living has a voice and a vote, and the

23 only way to do that-- the only way to do that is to

24 allow folks the power to step into the voting booth

25 and exercise that right. You can't just say that we

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 85  
2 as elected officials, we're just going to look out  
3 for you. We're just-- don't worry, we got you. You  
4 don't need to vote for us to be able to do that.  
5 It's nonsense, and we know it. Generation after  
6 generation we have seen our people be left behind  
7 because they have not had that power. So I'm  
8 grateful for Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez and  
9 stand firmly with him and the rest of the coalition  
10 to say that we need to pass this and we need to pass  
11 this now. We should not be waiting another decades,  
12 another minute to get this done. Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member  
14 Ydanis Rodriguez?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible]  
16 the hearing of Government Operations, I couldn't  
17 control my emotion because I came here to wash dishes  
18 at Old Henry Restaurant at West 46<sup>th</sup> Avenue. And  
19 then now it's a Capital Bank when I pass by. And  
20 then my second job was working [inaudible]  
21 Corporation, a cafeteria inside Two Broadway. So  
22 when that happened [inaudible] having meet with the  
23 DOT Commissioner, and it's those days that my  
24 daughter go to her school, I walk by and see them in  
25 the front, and I share with them that reality. So

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 86  
2 this is different from all the bill about regulating  
3 how people vote, right? This is not about amending  
4 anything that we have different interpretation. This  
5 is about how the City of New York have the  
6 responsibility to go back to our New York State  
7 Constitution of 197-- 1777 that allow people no  
8 citizen to vote, and that point of time were longer  
9 as Public Advocate Jumaane Williams stated today.  
10 People voting without being citizen, then people not  
11 being allowed to vote because they're not citizen.  
12 How did it happen? When did it happen? What fear  
13 does it bring? Go to Texas. See what's going on  
14 there. Why are they passing legislation? To secure,  
15 to be sure that they will establish that no citizen  
16 will not, able to vote. Because the federal law of  
17 our country established that in order to vote in  
18 federal election, President by President, Members of  
19 the House of Representatives, senator, it is a must  
20 to be citizen. Now when my collage, goof friend  
21 Borelli, that even though we don't agree with this  
22 he's my good friend and we do a lot of work together  
23 and we have a lot respect to each other, disagree  
24 that the New York State Constitution never use the  
25 word "only." When they talk about citizen have the

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 87  
2 right to vote. They don't use the word only. You  
3 don't find it. And that's [inaudible]. That's the  
4 piece [inaudible] real unusual of the Washington Post  
5 story today. Hear from the academic what are the  
6 same, that we have the right to do it. So it's  
7 interesting that besides two or three colleagues,  
8 right, that took the floor to address the 30 days,  
9 right? The rest [inaudible] to my Trump supporters.  
10 They don't agree with 30 days. They've been speaking  
11 about why we should not pass this bill. So they will  
12 not be voting for this bill. This the Democratic  
13 agenda. This is about us showing Texas, San Antonio,  
14 Colorado, other states how we do business. What is  
15 democracy all about it? That's what we're doing. My  
16 good friend, Majority Speaker, you have a great  
17 conversation with Berta Louis [sp?] from the Black  
18 Institute, and she show them number to you. And she  
19 showed to you that close to 400,000 new voters are  
20 black. They come from Nigeria. They came from Mali.  
21 They come from Ghana, they are [sp?], Haitian.  
22 They're Jamaican, close to 400,000. And for those  
23 that want to bring fear on the 30-day, let me give  
24 you a number. From-- the close to a million new  
25 voters. Right now 800,000 number is the number that

This is  
Ydanis  
Rodríguez  
claiming  
the  
numbers  
will  
support  
the  
Black  
community

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 88  
2 we're using. Five hundred thousands are individuals  
3 that have green cards. So for those that want to  
4 bring fear about the undocumented, my brother,  
5 [inaudible] undocumented within [sic] New York City  
6 working at the deli, working in supermarket. They  
7 did the same job that I did from '83 to 2000 when I  
8 had a green card and I worked at Old Henry Restaurant  
9 in the cafeteria, driving a taxi, being at City  
10 College organizing the student [inaudible], graduated  
11 from City College and being a teacher from '93 to  
12 2000 at [inaudible] school. I did it with green  
13 card. I don't want to challenge anyone who believe  
14 that the US citizen [inaudible] higher level, because  
15 I compare myself. When did we come to this  
16 conclusion? When? [inaudible] look like in movies  
17 and think about a place in this world where human  
18 beings are living together, and a group is telling  
19 the others you are here for years working hard,  
20 paying taxes, and you don't have a right [inaudible].  
21 For God sake--

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Ydanis--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Let's get it  
24 done. Let's vote no on this amendment. Si se puede.

25 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader?



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 89

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We will now take a  
3 roll call vote? Yes, Speaker Corey Johnson?

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: There has been a robust  
5 and lively debate on the floor of the New York City  
6 Council. It doesn't happen often here, but I'm glad  
7 we're having this debate, and all I want to say is  
8 today needs to be a historic day for our city, for  
9 our country. This is the right thing to do. Let's  
10 not get distracted. Let's get this done. I implore  
11 all of my colleagues and friends to vote no on this  
12 motion to recommit, to vote no on any amendment, and  
13 to get to the bill, and let's prove it. Thank you  
14 very much. I ask for a roll call vote on Council  
15 Member Gjonaj's motion to recommit.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Speaker  
17 Johnson.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: [inaudible]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Excuse me? Oh,  
21 yes, ma'am.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you very  
23 much, Madam Majority Leader. Respectfully, welcoming  
24 our newest members, Council Members Cabán and our  
25 Council Member Inna, and Council Member Carr.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 90

2 Welcome to the New York City Council. We are  
3 experiencing an amazing day today, and for that I  
4 congratulate all of my colleagues for this spirited  
5 debate. Mr. Speaker, I only rise to express my  
6 opinion. Twelve years is too long for any piece of  
7 legislation to languish, particularly a piece of  
8 legislation that affects thousands upon thousands of  
9 people who pay taxes in the City of New York that  
10 contribute to our wellbeing as citizens of the City  
11 of New York, and for one who will be returning in  
12 January as a member of this amazing body, what I say  
13 to my colleagues is that 12 years is 12 years too  
14 long for this legislation. We must make this happen  
15 today, and for those of us returning in January, it  
16 will be incumbent upon us to amend this legislation  
17 if we deem so necessary. I vote aye. I vote no on  
18 the amendment, but I will vote aye on the bill.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Hold on. It's not the  
20 amendment. You vote no on the motion to recommit.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Yes.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: You vote no on the  
23 motion to recommit?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Yes, Mr. Speaker,  
25 I do vote no on the motion to recommit--

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 91

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. Thank you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: respectfully to my  
4 amazing colleague, Council Member Gjonaj.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Council  
6 Member Adams.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Ampry-Samuel?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: I vote no.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Everyone at this  
11 time needs to vote at the microphone.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote no.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I  
16 vote no on this motion to recommit. We cannot  
17 disenfranchise and deny people who are entitled to  
18 vote the opportunity to vote in local elections.  
19 Thank you.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brannan?  
21 Council Member Brannan? Brooks-Powers?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We'll come back.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabán?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I vote no.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera? Carr?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 92

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: I vote yes.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Chin?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote no.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Cornegy?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Yes.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Darma Diaz?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I vote no.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Ruben Diaz?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Permission to

11 explain my vote?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission

13 granted.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, Madam

15 Majority. I have this black guy with kinky hair and

16 a broken English from [inaudible] Puerto Rico is a US

17 citizen, but when I go to Puerto Rico being a US

18 citizen, I cannot vote for President of the United

19 States because the Constitution, because the law

20 requires so. When I got elected as a Council Member

21 I swear to you with my hand in the bible to protect

22 and defend the Constitution of the United States.

23 Today, I cannot vote against the Constitution even

24 though it sounds good, possibly a good quality and a

25 humanitarian thing, but this black guy with kinky

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 93

2 hair, broken English from [inaudible] Puerto Rico is  
3 voting yes in this [inaudible].

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Dinowitz?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I first just  
6 want to thank every single person who spoke on this  
7 for speaking from the heart, and I want to say I  
8 deeply respect everyone's view and respect everyone  
9 for sharing their thoughts. I vote no on the motion  
10 to recommit.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote no on the  
13 motion, because I support my immigrant constituents.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote no.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Feliz?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: I vote no.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gennaro?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote no.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gjonaj?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Grodenchik?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 94

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I vote aye.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: No.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote no to the

8 amendment.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: How did he vote?

11 Council Member Koo, how did you vote, yes or no?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote no to the

13 amendment.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you Council Member

15 Koo. Koslowitz?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: No.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: No.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Lander?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: You couldn't

21 hear me? That wasn't loud enough? I vote no.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brannan?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: No.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 95

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: No on the motion

3 to recommit.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine? Louis?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I vote no. And

6 I'm hoping when the incoming class comes in that we

7 can do this the right way, implementing it the right

8 way.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: In the name of

13 restoring rights, voting rights, to our New Yorkers,

14 I vote no on the motion.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Nay [sic]

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Moya?

18 Perkins? Powers?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: No.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: No.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Riley?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: No.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rivera?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote no.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 96

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I vote no, and  
4 for clarification, Council Member Diaz was signing on  
5 this bill when he was running for Congress, but I  
6 vote no on this.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to  
9 explain my vote?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
11 granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. I want  
13 to say that this is one of the few times-- I've been  
14 here 12 years-- that I've seen such spirited debate.  
15 I came to the floor with a notion to vote a certain  
16 way, and so I appreciate the debate and all the  
17 thoughtful comments that were made by my colleagues.  
18 I am going to vote no for this motion, but it is with  
19 reservation, because I do feel that 30 days is not a  
20 sufficient amount of time to be invested in this  
21 country and this city. And so I'm voting against the  
22 amendment after much-- hearing much of the debate,  
23 but I do hope that when this pass, and I know it will  
24 pass, that we will look at making sure that people  
25 who vote-- and I'm not talking about the people who



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 97

2 are here now who have green cards, but people who  
3 come here really have a vested interested, and that  
4 this not be used to-- for other purposes. So I'm  
5 voting no.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
7 Member Rose.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I vote no.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote no.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I vote no on the  
14 motion.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote yes on the  
17 motion to recommit.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Yes on the  
20 motion.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: On behalf of  
23 the people of Woodside [sic] and Sunnyside, Long  
24 Island City, and Astoria, and in memory of my  
25 grandmother, I am proud to vote no.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 98

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Vernikov?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: I vote yes on  
4 the motion.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Yeger?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President,  
7 May I be excused to explain my vote?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
9 granted.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you very  
11 much. I appreciate it. You know, we don't get to  
12 debate often enough in the Council, I believe. My  
13 colleagues who are here for 12 years probably agree  
14 with me. I'm only here four years and I've had more  
15 debate when I was on a Community Board than I've had  
16 here. So I appreciate the chance to do this. I'll  
17 say a number of things. First of all, you know, this  
18 was a motion to send it back to a committee. It's  
19 not a motion about whether or not you want immigrants  
20 to vote or not vote or any of that, but it became  
21 important during the course of this debate that  
22 everybody has to discuss their personal story. So,  
23 my story, because I've said this before on this  
24 floor. My father came here on a boat with his  
25 parents and his older brothers. He-- my four

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 99

2 grandparents, none of whom were born here, in various

3 trips escaped the atrocities of Nazi Germany from

4 various places, from Poland, from Lithuania, from

5 Russia. One of my grandfathers made his way from

6 Russia over the water into Japan where he was able to

7 live for a few years-- for a few days, until he was

8 able to move to China to Shanghai where he stayed for

9 several years before being welcomed into the United

10 States. They didn't have the right to vote. This is

11 not about their right to vote. None of them have seen

12 me be elected. They never missed an election, by the

13 way, after they became citizens, but none of them saw

14 me elected, they weren't alive. My grandmother was.

15 She was actually my constituent until she passed away

16 a year ago. So one of my grandparents did see it.

17 It's an American Dream, the right to vote. This

18 debate now was not about the right to vote. It was

19 about a motion to send it back to a committee. So

20 what happens here at the Council? We know the rule,

21 because we've seen it for the last four years. I've

22 seen it for a long time in politics. Whoever doesn't

23 agree with you must be a racist. Must be. Has to

24 be. You don't agree with me, you love white power.

25 You have to be. You don't agree with me, you're a

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 100  
2 Trumpist. You don't agree with me, it's because you  
3 hate Latinos. Twenty years ago when I was working  
4 for the historic campaign of a candidate for Mayor of  
5 New York who was of Puerto Rican descent, the  
6 gentleman who just referenced another member of this  
7 body's support for this bill was supporting the  
8 Jewish candidate 20 years ago. When I was supporting  
9 Fernando Ferrer and the gentleman was supporting Mark  
10 Green. Don't come here and tell us that we're racist  
11 because we don't agree with you. When have I ever  
12 said that to you? When has anybody who's on the  
13 other side of you ever said that to you or anybody  
14 else? It happens all the time. Mr. Speaker, you know  
15 you've seen it for the last four years. It happens  
16 all the time. Don't agree with me, you're a racist.  
17 You're a Trumpist. You're this, you're that. How  
18 about I just have a policy difference? How about I  
19 read the Constitution? I went to law school just  
20 like the lawyers in this Council and I read the  
21 Constitution and it means something to me. No, it  
22 has to be we're racists, has to be. You're leaving  
23 the Council in 20 days. It's a chance to stand up  
24 and say, you know, maybe not everybody who disagrees  
25 with me is racist. I know not everybody who

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 101  
2 disagrees with me is racist, and I'll say that. So  
3 with that, I vote aye on the motion to send it back  
4 to the Committee, which I'm proud to serve, and the  
5 Council which may hear it next year or may not, but  
6 I'm thankful to my neighbors for sending me back here  
7 to do their work. Thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
9 Member Yeger. And I just want to make a reminder  
10 that I was supposed to make earlier that in our  
11 comments, we should refrain from referencing one  
12 another in our statements. So let's continue to-- I  
13 mistakenly did it as well, but we should not mention  
14 either of us by name, because we can't continue a  
15 continuous debate. Council Member Borelli, you were  
16 going to speak? Oh, you were just stretching. I'm  
17 sorry? Oh, okay, yes.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Permission  
20 to explain my vote?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: So, just  
24 wanted to put on record that I'm looking forward to  
25 the next Council to be able to work to perfect this

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 102  
2 bill, one that I definitely support as a co-sponsor,  
3 as a first-generation American, but I do find to have  
4 some concerns which I have been working alongside the  
5 prime sponsor with the hopes of perfecting this piece  
6 of legislation, and it is my hope that in the next  
7 council we are able to take it a step further. So,  
8 while I support the concept of this bill, the bill as  
9 it is written currently, I have concerns about, but  
10 for the purpose of this motion, I will vote no on  
11 sending it back to committee. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
13 Member.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. One last  
15 time, Cabrera? Levine? Microphone, Council Member,  
16 please.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote no on the  
18 motion.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Moya?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote no on the  
21 motion.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Perkins?  
23 Borelli?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on the  
25 motion.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 103

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: In the spirit of  
4 wanting to know more information, in the spirit of  
5 wanting to be able to ask more questions, in the  
6 spirit of just simply saying, I do not have enough  
7 information to know how this particular bill will  
8 affect our city, and I want to be clear, the decision  
9 that we are making today is going to have national  
10 repercussions. What we are doing today is going to  
11 set a precedent throughout the nation. Are we moving  
12 in the right direction? Yes. Have we implemented as  
13 thoroughly as we should have? The answer is no, and  
14 I reserve the right to say we need to be at the  
15 drawing board to make better-informed decisions. I,  
16 as I said before, want to know specifically how it is  
17 going to impact African-American communities? This  
18 is a significant community in this city and this  
19 nation. All across the United States of America  
20 during the Presidential election, battleground states  
21 were talked about during the entire election and what  
22 meant was how are African-American going to come out  
23 to save this country from what was going to become  
24 another demise of the next four years. We need to--  
25 following this particular vote, black and brown

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 104  
2 communities need to come together to understand how  
3 we are going to work collectively together, because  
4 throughout these elections we have seen that on so  
5 many elections, the African-American community has  
6 been the community to save the day, and it ws  
7 mentioned by other colleagues about our Republican  
8 colleagues. African-American as a whole, as a block,  
9 have remained true to the ideals of the Democratic  
10 Party. We have to make sure that we work together  
11 collaboratively, that we make sure that black and  
12 brown communities understand that we have had many of  
13 the same experiences in this country and that we have  
14 to work collaboratively and together. We saw in the  
15 presidential election that many other ethnic groups  
16 voted Republican jeopardizing the entire future of  
17 this country by voting Republican. No offense to my  
18 Republican brothers and sisters here. I just want to  
19 be clear here, that my concern is how this is going  
20 to impact African-American communities. We can't  
21 leave that up to circumstance. It's not a  
22 coincidence. We can't just let whatever happens  
23 happen. This is a very vulnerable group in the City  
24 of New York that has sacrificed too much for every  
25 single person in this room. So I vote yes, because I



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 105  
2 reserve my right to ask more questions, to make this  
3 a more effective bill. No one has the answer as to  
4 how this is going to impact African-American  
5 communities. Nobody has the numbers how it's going  
6 to impact the City of New York. No one knows, but  
7 the bill sounds good, so we're voting it through.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote no. Proudly  
10 vote no.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: By a vote of 14 in  
12 the affirmative, 35 in the negative, and 0  
13 abstention, the motion is defeated.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam  
15 Majority Leader. The Council will now consider the  
16 separate vote on Introduction 1867A. At this time I  
17 ask the Clerk for a roll call vote on Introduction  
18 1867A, as it was amended by the Committee on  
19 Governmental Operations, the bill we were going to  
20 vote on today, before we had this debate. I am  
21 requesting a roll call vote since it was decoupled, a  
22 roll call vote on that bill.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye. I vote aye.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 106

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Ayala?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel? My

5 apologies.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: I vote aye.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Barron?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brannan?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brooks-

12 Powers? Cabán? Cabrera? Carr?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Nay.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Chin?

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: That was a no, correct?

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Yes. Yes, Mr. Speaker.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I proudly vote aye.

18 Finally.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Permission to

21 explain my vote?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission

23 granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: As I stated at

25 the beginning of this debate, I was an original

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 107  
2 sponsor on this bill. I asked for-- I voted yes on  
3 the motion to recommit because I think that there's  
4 much more work that could be done on the bill. I will  
5 be voting yes with a reasonable expectation that as  
6 we move forward and we discuss issues around voter  
7 disenfranchisement in the black community, as we  
8 support or don't support Stacey Abrams as she fights  
9 for voter rights for black people, as we continue to  
10 fight for the full restoration of the Voter Rights  
11 Acts that were put in place for black communities,  
12 that I can get the same support going forward. Now I  
13 won't be a member of this body, but that fight for  
14 myself and my family will never stop because I think  
15 it's essential and it's part in partial about true  
16 democracy in the city. so my vote yes, with the  
17 reasonable expectation that everybody on this body,  
18 all my progressive colleagues will stand in  
19 solidarity with me as I fight for full restoration of  
20 the Voter Rights Acts, as I fight for an end to voter  
21 disenfranchisement across the country as it relates  
22 to black people. Thank you. I vote aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Darma Diaz?  
24  
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 108

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I vote aye, but I'd  
3 like to explain my vote or just make a comment, if  
4 that's okay, Majority Leader?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes, ma'am.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I just-- I want to  
7 begin just by thanking you all for this healthy  
8 conversation. As a community advocate who's worked  
9 with many residents that would have liked to have  
10 been able to vote, it's a historic day. As for  
11 African-Americans, I've made it my business to take  
12 time to go down south to take that walk, to try to  
13 have a better understanding. As a Puerto Rican, as a  
14 woman, I get it. To the nonprofits that are out  
15 there that by my accord, abuse of [sic] residents,  
16 today's a new day. It was hard for me to walk the  
17 walk and canvas and hear my people that advocated  
18 with me for over 20 years, [inaudible] across the  
19 street from City Hall advocating for new schools to  
20 tell me that they were not a deciding factor. I  
21 [inaudible] supported at the hierarchies [sic] and  
22 their organizations made that decision for them. I  
23 hope they understand [speaking Spanish] Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Gracias.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 109

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Ruben Diaz? Council  
3 Member Ruben Diaz, Senior?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [inaudible] I was  
5 out of my office. What are we voting for now?

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We're voting on the  
7 bill itself. So, whether your support the bill or  
8 not.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Okay, alright.  
10 Alright, I vote no.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Dinowitz?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I vote yes.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye,  
15 because as in the words of Langston Hughes, this will  
16 bring America closer to being America again. Thank  
17 you.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Feliz?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: I vote aye, and  
22 briefly, I just feel compelled to say that we've seen  
23 and heard different perspectives from people of all  
24 backgrounds. I just felt compelled to say that we  
25 shouldn't throw the word "racism" anytime that we

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 110

2 have a disagreement with others, regardless of how  
3 difficult the issue is. Thank you.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gennaro?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: I vote no. I  
6 wish to be associated with the comments of Council  
7 Member Feliz. I vote no.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Gennaro,  
9 can you clarify that? How do you vote?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Oh, I'm saying  
11 that I'm voting no on the bill--

12 COUNCIL CLERK: [interposing] Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: but I want to be  
14 associated with the comments of Council Member Feliz.  
15 I agree with his comments, but I'm voting no on the  
16 bill.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Got it. Thank you.

18 Gibson? Council Member Gibson?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Colleagues, on  
20 behalf of my district and many residents and families  
21 who will benefit from this, both from the West  
22 African and [inaudible] I vote yes.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gjonaj?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Pass.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 111

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I vote no on  
3 1867, aye on the rest, and I welcome my new  
4 colleagues. I'm not going to be here much longer--

5 COUNCIL CLERK: [interposing] Council  
6 Member Grodenchik--

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] We're just  
8 voting on the single bill. The bill was decoupled.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: OH, I'm  
10 sorry, Mr. Speaker. I vote no on 1867.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Holden?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I vote no.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Yes.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council  
16 Member Koo? Council Member Koo? Koslowitz?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: No.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request  
20 permission to explain my vote?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madam  
24 Majority Leader. I do deeply appreciate debate on the  
25 floor of this body. I think it is good for us to have

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 112

2 really strong debate and disagree respectfully here.

3 I will say I think it is profoundly disingenuous,

4 however, to make it seem as though if immigrants just

5 work hard, they could become citizens in this country

6 when Republicans in Congress are denying 11 million

7 Americans a path to citizenship and have been doing

8 so for decades. If we lived in a country where

9 citizenship was offered to all who want it, then it

10 might make sense to say on the floor of this body

11 that that should be an expectation of voting, but in

12 the country we are living and where immigrants are

13 denied basic human dignity and yet expected to

14 perform jobs that are essential to us through this

15 pandemic. I find it a really disingenuous argument.

16 We are voting to expand municipal voting rights to

17 our immigrant neighbors in big part because they have

18 been denied a path to citizenship by Congress, and

19 that is why I'm so proud of what we're doing today.

20 I think is not only profoundly morally right, I think

21 it's economically smart for New York City to be a

22 place where immigrants can come and participate fully

23 in our economy and in our democracy. It heralds a

24 strong and bright future for this city which has

25 always been an immigrant city which brings people in



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 113  
2 and enfranchises them. That is how our whole city  
3 thrives, not only our immigrant neighbors, but every  
4 single one of us. So, with bright hope for the  
5 future of inclusive multiracial democracy in New York  
6 City, I vote aye.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council  
8 Member Levin?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye,  
10 proudly.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote aye,  
13 proudly.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Louis?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I vote aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Maisel?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: No.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Hang on Council Member.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: No.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Menchaca?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to  
22 explain my vote?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
24 granted.  
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 114  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,  
3 Majority Leader, and thank you to this incredible  
4 Council. We are two States away from ending this  
5 session, and I feel-- have a lot of feelings right  
6 now, but I just want to say thank you for listening,  
7 for speaking your truth. I hope that you feel heard,  
8 and I know that we don't always agree, but I want to  
9 get to the core of so many pieces that I heard that I  
10 felt were connected to things like fear. That is  
11 what will prevent us from moving forward as one city,  
12 our city, our vote. What I kept being reminded of are  
13 the immigrant communities that came out without being  
14 asked during Sandy to rebuild. The day laborers  
15 across the entire city came out and rebuilt our city.  
16 They weren't asked to do that. Even when their homes  
17 were broken they came out. It's time and time again  
18 I've seen immigrants come out and say no to  
19 atrocities that they have been experiencing like the  
20 [speaking Spanish]. They have come out and said we  
21 need changes in the law. Most of them could not  
22 vote. These are the people that will continue to  
23 make our city better and they will be reflected in  
24 our institutions of government as representatives  
25 because of that vote, which will be a better city.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 115

2 That's why I'm saying yes, but I also want to say  
3 thank you to you all the incredible coalition that  
4 held strong over the years. New York Immigration  
5 Coalition, thank you for your leadership on this and  
6 the Black Institute, CPC, [inaudible], out of my  
7 district, so many of you that have been doing the  
8 work on the ground to do things like participatory  
9 budgeting, so that we can experiment about what  
10 happens when we bring people out of the shadows and  
11 into government to make decisions in our  
12 neighborhood. At one point, more people voted in PB  
13 than the people who voted in the Democratic Primary  
14 to elect me as the City Council. That's the energy  
15 that's waiting. And I want to associate my remarks  
16 with Brad Lander who spoke about people who are  
17 waiting right now but because of the reform that is  
18 not happening at the federal level, they wait, and  
19 they languish in the shadows, and today, we're going  
20 to bring the light and we're going to bring the love,  
21 and I want to say thank you. I vote aye.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, Council  
23 Member. Council Member Miller? Council Member  
24 Miller only on Introduction 1867A.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: We'll come back. Moya?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 116

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Permission to  
3 explain my vote?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
5 granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Tank you Madam  
7 Majority Leader. TO me, this is a very personal vote  
8 that I take today. I'm the proud son of an  
9 Ecuadorian immigrants. I have the distinction of  
10 being the first Ecuadorian-American to ever be  
11 elected to public office, not just in the state of  
12 New York but in this country, and that would not have  
13 been possible without the hard work and effort of my  
14 parents. Voting is very important tradition in our  
15 household. We always go vote as a family, and  
16 there's always been one family member that's never  
17 had the opportunity to vote for their son, and that's  
18 my mom who's right here. And this is going to be for  
19 the women who has given the opportunity to be in  
20 elected office, and this one is for my Ma and for  
21 about 900,000 immigrants that have truly made a  
22 difference in the lives of so many here in New York.  
23 I proudly vote aye. This is for my beautiful mother  
24 who will get to vote for her son again. Thank you so  
25 much.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 117

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Council

3 Member Moya. Hi Mom.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Perkins?

5 Powers?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye.

7 Congratulations everyone who will now be able to

8 participate in very important decisions about the

9 City's future. I vote aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Reynoso?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Pass.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Got it. Riley?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rivera?

15 Rodriguez?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to

17 explain my vote?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: We would not

20 be here without Speaker Johnson and his team. Thank

21 you to him and to the great Chief of Staff, Jason,

22 Jim [sic], Kelly, Jeff. I want to also thank my

23 colleagues at the Council who are sponsoring today's

24 legislation, specifically Council Member Danny Dromm,

25 Council Member Margaret Chin. We are the three lead

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 118  
2 prime of this bill because we've been there since  
3 2009. I was so lucky to join the Council without  
4 waiting for January to be serving. I took office  
5 immediately, and this was one of the first bills that  
6 I signed when you were the lead prime. So for me  
7 this is a train that had never stopped. This is a  
8 train that started with Council Member Barron,  
9 Council Member Perkins. They were two great African-  
10 American leaders who led this fight and we follow  
11 them. So thank you. I also wanted to thank  
12 everyone, especially all the colleagues here,  
13 especially Council Member Fernando Cabrera, the Chair  
14 of the Government Operation Committee because of his  
15 leadership and his committee, all the member of that  
16 committee. Yesterday, we pass it, and then we are  
17 here. Last thing I would like to thank the New York  
18 Immigration Coalition, United Neighborhood Houses,  
19 our city of Coalition [sic], DACA recipients, my  
20 office staff, all of them, and Lisa, Evelyn [sic],  
21 Thomas, Von Troy [sp?], those of you who worked so  
22 hard to be sure that we were able to take this bill  
23 to where we are today. All of you worked tirelessly  
24 to get us to this point. It is not secret that today  
25 inside these Chambers the New York City Council is

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 119  
2 making history. Many other cities across the nation  
3 as well as abroad are watching this meeting today. In  
4 one of the most diverse cities in the world, we need  
5 to ensure that there is adequate representation for  
6 all New Yorkers. That starts by expanding the scope  
7 of who is allowed to vote in our local elections.  
8 Intro 1867 will allow lawful permanent residents in  
9 New York City to vote in municipal elections. That  
10 includes immigrants who have green cards, work  
11 authorization, DACA recipients, TPS. Our City Our  
12 Vote Campaign has been about giving a voice to the  
13 voiceless. I know what it is to feel like you live in  
14 the shadows working as a dishwasher, taxi driver. I  
15 know that- I know what it's like to live with a green  
16 card and having people always look down on because of  
17 my accent. Even they still believe that I have green  
18 card and they're so proud to have green card. My  
19 story is a story of every immigrant New Yorkers.  
20 Immigrants in New York own over half of the local  
21 businesses and contribute over 190 billion dollars to  
22 the citywide GDP. During the highs of the pandemic  
23 it was our immigrant New Yorkers who kept New York  
24 City running. They did not have the luxury of  
25 working from home or escaping to the Hampton or to

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 120  
2 the Hudson Valley. Over half of our frontline  
3 essential workers are immigrants and approximately  
4 one in five are non-citizen New Yorkers. They have  
5 all earned the right to participate in our elections.  
6 It is estimated that nearly one million immigrant New  
7 Yorkers will be eligible to vote. That includes  
8 nearly 100,000 Muslim immigrants who will be  
9 enfranchised by this bill. Additionally, according  
10 to the Black Institute, 50 percent of non-citizens  
11 are from Jamaica, Uganda [sic], Haiti, Trinidad and  
12 Tobago alone. Furthermore, others are Nigeria,  
13 Ghana, Mali, Congo and other countries in Africa, or  
14 they're from Europe or they're from Asia, or they're  
15 from Latin America. We are on track to write a new  
16 chapter in our city history, one that will finally  
17 include a voice of all immigrants of all New Yorkers  
18 who hold green cards or work authorization, DACAs or  
19 TPS. I also think it is important that we look at  
20 municipal voting as a midpoint not as a deterrent,  
21 giving New Yorkers with green card or working permit  
22 the right to vote for the local representative will  
23 encourage them to continue their path to citizenship  
24 so that they can later vote in federal election. In a  
25 time when many states are passing over suppression



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 121  
2 law like we haven't seen since the Jim Crow era, New  
3 York City-- and thank you Speaker Johnson. Because  
4 of your leadership, New York City must be seen as a  
5 shining example for all the progressive cities to  
6 follow. My hope is that 50 years down the line when  
7 our children look back and we will not be here, at  
8 this moment they will see a diverse coalition of  
9 fighters who came together to change New York City  
10 history by giving immigrant New Yorkers the power of  
11 the ballot. With that, proudly I vote aye.

12 [speaking Spanish]

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, Council  
14 Member. Council Member Rose?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. I vote  
16 aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rivera?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rosenthal?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I vote aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Salamanca?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Treyger?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I'm going to  
25 abstain for part of the reasons I mentioned earlier.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 122

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, Council

3 Member. Ulrich?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you. I vote

5 no on Introduction 1621A, 1867--

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Just

7 voting on the single bill right now.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I apologize.

9 Thank you. I was on a candy run and I didn't hear  
10 that announcement. So I do have Reese's Pieces if  
11 anybody's interested. If you have low blood sugar,  
12 let me know. If you're diabetic, stay away.

13 Alright. So this is just on the-- I vote no. Okay,  
14 alright. Thank you. Sorry.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Vallone?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: No.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: One of my  
19 proudest aye votes. I am very proud to vote yes.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Vernikov?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: I vote no.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council

23 Member Yeger?

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Kalman, the mic's not

25 on.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 123

2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President,  
3 may I be excused to explain my vote.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes, sir. Go ahead.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you. Thank  
6 you, Mr. Speaker. You know, after I spoke earlier,  
7 one of my colleagues mentioned to me, you know, why  
8 do you have your back to the cameras when you're  
9 talking, and it dawned on me as I listened to the  
10 remainder and I've reflected on the last four years  
11 about how frequently we speak for the cameras here.  
12 Not me, I don't. I speak-- I turn around. I've made  
13 it my point since we got back into these chambers  
14 always to face my colleagues. I'm not talking to the  
15 press. I'm not talking the viewer at home. I'm not  
16 talking to the clerks. I'm sorry that I always turn  
17 my back on you. I'm not talking to the President of  
18 the Council. I'm talking to my colleagues here.  
19 That's what we've been doing. We're a legislature.  
20 We debate. And you know, as I watched a lot of the  
21 performance, I haven't performed. My point when I  
22 make a point is to speak to my colleagues, try to  
23 convince you I'm right. Sometimes you agree with me.  
24 Most of the time you don't. That's okay. And my  
25 opposition to this bill is based on a simple reading

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 124  
2 of the Constitution. There's a basic tenant and  
3 statutory interpretation. My Latin is not as good as  
4 it used to be. I'm probably going to butcher it, but  
5 it essentially [speaking Latin]. When a statute, the  
6 Constitution, an ordinance, a rule, a measure says  
7 something in a category of things and doesn't say the  
8 other things in that category, it necessarily  
9 excludes those things. The Minority Leader did far  
10 more research than I did, and it's very clear that  
11 the Constitution of the State of New York reserves  
12 the right to vote to citizens. I didn't write the  
13 Constitution. Never served on a Constitutional  
14 Convention. We all, members of our party, voted  
15 against-- or supported opposition to the  
16 Constitutional Convention. We could have gotten up  
17 there and changed it if we did, if we wanted to.  
18 That's what the Constitution says. As I said at the  
19 Committee a few days, if we want to change and bring  
20 more people to enfranchisement with the right to  
21 vote, then there's a way to do it. Albany can do it.  
22 Very simple, we do not have the legal authority to do  
23 this. We don't. Want it-- I wanted legal authority  
24 to do a lot of things that I don't have the legal  
25 authority to do, that's life. That's the oath we

1                   NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING       125  
2    took, the oath to support the Constitution of the  
3    United States and the Constitution of the State of  
4    New York. I'm voting no on this bill, thank you very  
5    much, and I do that with respect, with respect to the  
6    colleagues with whom I've served for the last four  
7    years, with respect to Mr. Speaker, with respect to  
8    the President of the Council, and even with the  
9    respect to the sponsor of this bill. No matter what  
10   he says, I will still have respect for him. But the  
11   discourse here today I think is something that we all  
12   ought to recognize is not how a body should be. It's  
13   not what this body should be, and it's unfortunately  
14   something we've seen far too often. Thank you very  
15   much, Madam President.

16                   COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

17                   COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brooks-  
18   Powers?

19                   COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Permission  
20   to explain my vote?

21                   COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
22   granted.

23                   COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: So first,  
24   I want to take a moment to congratulate my colleague,  
25   Council Member Rodriguez, and the coalition of

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 126  
2 advocates behind this bill who worked very hard to  
3 empower our immigrant communities and give them a  
4 stronger voice in local government. As a first  
5 generation American, I recognize this bill is a major  
6 step for justice in representation for these vibrant  
7 communities. And when I say as a first generation  
8 American, I don't mean something far removed, I mean  
9 both my parents born in another country, siblings  
10 current green card holders. So this is an issue that  
11 is very near and dear to me. However, I have been  
12 working to have a concern raised by the constituents  
13 who have sent me here to the Council to represent  
14 them addressed for almost over a month, and that  
15 issue, unfortunately, was unable to be addressed in  
16 time for today's vote. And as a result of this  
17 concern which is the 30-day provision that is in the  
18 bill, I will have to unfortunately abstain my vote on  
19 this bill, that I felt very deeply about, and quite I  
20 feel robbed in this moment as well. But I am looking  
21 forward to taking up the mantle that my colleague is  
22 leaving behind to perfect and improve this bill in  
23 the next council where we can address the many  
24 concerns that were raised. It's unfortunate, but  
25 this is a-- this is where we can be able to improve

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 127  
2 the Council in terms of our process and our ability  
3 to talk with one another about issues and really  
4 sharpen one another around these different nuances  
5 with legislation. And so that is truly a Council I'm  
6 looking forward to serving in in the next Council.  
7 Thank you so much.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Cabán?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Very proudly vote  
11 aye, and thrilled that this is my first vote. Thank  
12 you.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Cabrera?  
14 Gjonaj?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to  
16 explain my vote?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
18 granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you,  
20 Majority Leader. To my brother Ydanis, your hard  
21 work has proven that success comes with hard work.  
22 I'm grateful that you know this was not personal in  
23 any way. And for the colleagues that do know me,  
24 thank you for the message that you are not a racist.  
25 This was an honest conversation and a debate. And

1                   NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING           128  
2   I'm grateful to have been able to be a part of it  
3   without fear of being labeled or for fear of being  
4   cancelled out, because that's not what government is  
5   and that's not the roles that we have and  
6   responsibilities that we have to our constituents and  
7   the positions and the office that we hold. I'm  
8   hopeful that this bill will become a better bill with  
9   the new Council, that you'll have the time to discuss  
10   and make a piece of legislation that will assure and  
11   protect New York City. This bill in its current form  
12   for 30 days of anyone visiting this country being  
13   able to vote is a threat to our sovereignty. And  
14   with that, I regret that I have to vote no on this  
15   bill. I would have loved to have voted yes moving  
16   forward. I'd sharpen this to be the best bill that  
17   it could be, because that's what New Yorkers deserve.  
18   That's what immigrants deserve, and that's what this  
19   City warrants from us. I vote no. Thank you.

20                   COUNCIL CLERK:    Thank you.   Koo?

21                   COUNCIL MEMBER KOO:   I vote yes.

22                   COUNCIL CLERK:    Thank you.   Miller?

23                   COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER:   I vote yes.

24                   COUNCIL CLERK:    Thank you.   Reynoso?

25



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 129

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to  
3 explain my vote?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
5 granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I just want to  
7 congratulate Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez and  
8 Danny Dromm that the great work that they did on  
9 pushing this bill, and for our Speaker Corey Johnson.  
10 It's not an easy thing to do, and many of times in  
11 our Council and four years in his speakership, we've  
12 taken on tough votes. He never did it because it was  
13 easy. He always thought-- he always did it because  
14 it ws right. So, I just want to thank you, Corey,  
15 for putting this together. And to all of the  
16 immigrants that have come to this country to  
17 contribute, you finally are going to get an  
18 opportunity to choose who represents you, and I  
19 couldn't be prouder today to vote. Aye on this bill.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Borelli?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you. I  
22 vote no.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: This is perhaps  
25 the hardest vote that I've taken since I've been in

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 130  
2 the Council, and I just want to-- I just want to  
3 address, because we're not addressing members by  
4 name, it was mentioned here that many of the  
5 communities that will benefit are many of our African  
6 immigrants from the Congo, from Mali, from Nigeria,  
7 but according to the research that I saw at the Black  
8 Institute, the African community is negligible in  
9 terms of the level-- this is not going to amplify  
10 their voices in a meaningful way in the City of New  
11 York. According to the Black Institute data that was  
12 also given to me, the top three ethnic groups that  
13 will benefit from this is the Dominican Republic,  
14 China, as well as Mexico. Those are the three groups  
15 that are going to benefit the most from this in a  
16 very substantial way. The other groups that my  
17 colleague mentioned are not even in the top 10, and  
18 my concern again, is how the African-American  
19 community will fair in a situation where our numbers  
20 are not amplified in any meaningful way. So I  
21 continue to be concerned about that. At Dem  
22 Conference I also mentioned, just honestly speaking,  
23 you know, this is a conversation that the black and  
24 Latino community has to have. It has not happened,  
25 because it's not politically correct, but it's a

She disputes

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 131  
2 conversation that needs to happen. I continue to  
3 remain concerned. As I read in Dem Conference about  
4 during the presidential election how many of our  
5 Latino brothers and sisters voted Republican for  
6 President Trump. That concerns me of activating this  
7 particular bill because of that reason. I understand  
8 that's not politically correct. I understand that  
9 people are going to have challenges with it. I need  
10 my Latino brothers and sisters to know that they are  
11 African brothers and sisters. You are African and we  
12 need to move forward collectively as African people  
13 and to stop the divisions. We are not black and  
14 brown. We are multiple shades of black. And I'm  
15 just going to conclude with that, and I'm going to  
16 say on this bill I vote no. I encourage the next  
17 Council to vote on a bill that's better, that is more  
18 constructive, that brings all the different multiple  
19 perspectives into play, that answers key questions on  
20 how it's going to impact the City of New York, and  
21 how it empowers all communities moving forward.  
22 Thank you so much. I turn it over back to Speaker  
23 Johnson.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 132

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I proudly vote aye on  
3 this bill. Congratulations to Council Member  
4 Rodriquez and to all the advocates. Today is a  
5 historic day for New York City and for the United  
6 States of America. Congratulations, Ydanis.

7 [applause]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: By a vote of 33 in  
9 the affirmative, 14 in the negative, and 2  
10 abstentions. Intro 1867A is hereby adopted.  
11 Congratulations, Council Member Rodriguez.

12 [applause]

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We still have a whole  
14 lot of voting to do, so let's try to get through it.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Only--

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Yeah, we  
17 have a quorum.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We are now back  
19 into the discussion of General Orders. Moving onto--

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Are people  
21 signed up for it?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes, it is.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Oh, people should maybe  
24 think about waving their time and speaking during  
25 their allotted voting window.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 133

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay. I will call  
3 on each member and-- these are on the bills that we  
4 are about to vote on.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: And they could also  
6 take time to speak when they vote instead of speaking  
7 now.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And Speaker Corey  
9 Johnson has recommended that you speak when your bill  
10 is put forward for a vote when it is your turn to  
11 vote. So, I will-- out of fairness, I will call on a  
12 member. You can decide to speak or say I will  
13 reserve my time for my vote. We will begin with  
14 Council Member Treyger followed by Holden, Menchaca,  
15 Feliz, and Barron.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Council Member Treyger?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Majority Leader,  
18 I will pass.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council  
20 Member Treyger. Council Member Holden?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [inaudible]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Good idea.

23 Council Member Menchaca?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [inaudible]

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 134

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Wow, alright.

3 Council Member Feliz?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: I'll deliver my  
5 remarks on voting. Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. And  
7 Council Member Barron?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: You almost made  
9 it through, but I promise it won't be two minutes.

10 [applause]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I just want to  
12 speak to my colleagues very briefly about Intro Nine.  
13 All of you know that my background is education.  
14 It's interesting to share a brief story since we're  
15 telling stories and sharing memories. When I was  
16 appointed as a principal at PS81, my mother and I  
17 went to the school to bless the school, and her  
18 blessing was that I would have it easy, but my prayer  
19 was that Lord, don't let anything significant or  
20 major happen to any of my children while I'm here.  
21 Their safety was of utmost concern to me, and it's in  
22 that vein that I'm introducing Intro Nine, yes, one,  
23 two, three, four, five, six, seven, eight, nine,  
24 which says that by September 30<sup>th</sup>, the Department of  
25 Transportation will identify each intersection

1                   NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING           135  
2           immediately adjacent to a school that does not have a  
3           traffic control device such as a stop sign or traffic  
4           control, and that by no later than September 30<sup>th</sup>,  
5           2024, the DOT would have installed a traffic control  
6           device at each such intersection. And I just want to  
7           thank-- it was originally introduced as an Intro-- I  
8           mean, as a Reso, but we fought and the legal team  
9           helped to design it so that it could be a Local Law.  
10          and I just want to thank Corey Johnson, Jason  
11          Goldman, Ydanis Rodriguez, Director Jeff Baker,  
12          Tereza Nassa [sp?], Brad Lee [sp?], Elliott Lynn,  
13          Jessica Albin [sp?], Rick Arbello [sp?], Kevin  
14          Koslowtiz, and my staff, Chief of Staff Amawali Clay  
15          [sp?], and my Legislative Director and CUNY Liaison  
16          Indigo Washington, and I just want to say that Ms.  
17          Washington will be leaving. Tomorrow is her last  
18          day, and I'll have more comments on that at a later  
19          portion of the meeting. Thank you.

20                   COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:    Thank you,  
21          Council Member Barron. We will now move into the  
22          discussion of General Orders.

23                   SPEAKER JOHNSON:   We just did.  
24  
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 136

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Excuse me, I'm  
3 sorry. We'll now move into report of special  
4 committees.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Before we get there, I  
7 want to just-- before I forget, I want to wish our  
8 colleague, Council Member-- I feel bad she's had to  
9 endure this on her birthday, Council Member Adrienne  
10 Adams, happy birthday. Very happy birthday to you.

11 [applause]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: What a way to  
13 spend your birthday.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: She wants to hear about  
15 the reports of standing committees.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
17 on Civil Service and Labor, Preconsidered Intro 2454  
18 collective bargaining.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
20 Orders.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
22 on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing, Intro  
23 2130A, student loan forgiveness.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
25 General Orders.



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 137

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
3 on Contracts, Intro 1624A minority and women-owned  
4 business enterprises.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
6 General Orders.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
8 on Environmental Protection, Intro 51A, geothermal  
9 exchange systems.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
11 General Orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2425A Borough-- DEP  
13 Borough Commissioners.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
15 General Orders.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2460A Environmental  
17 remediation.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
19 General Orders.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee  
21 on Finance, Intro 1520A Parking Violations Bureau.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
23 General Orders.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Into 2458 Business  
25 Improvement District.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 138

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General

3 Orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1839,

5 transparency resolution.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General

7 Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 939 and

9 Reso 1841 through Preconsidered LU 943 and Reso 1845

10 tax exemption.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General

12 Orders.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee

14 on Fire and Emergency Management, Intro 1949A,

15 emergency plans.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on

17 General Orders.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee

19 on General Welfare, Intro 147A and 2176A supportive

20 housing.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on

22 General Orders.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee

24 on Governmental Operations, Intro 1621A Nuclear

25 Disarmament Advisory Committee.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 139

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
3 General Orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2459A, Office of  
5 Information Privacy.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
7 General Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
9 on Health, Intro 1625B non-surgical contraception.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
11 General Orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
13 on Housing and Buildings, Intro 2309A, short term  
14 rentals.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
16 General Orders.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
18 on Land Use, Intro 2443A, joint living working  
19 quarters for artists.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved and laid over.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 899 through 904, 175  
22 Park Avenue, and LU 906 and 907, 250 Water Street.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with  
24 modifications and referred to the City Planning  
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 140

2 Commission pursuant to Section 197D of the New York  
3 City Charter.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: LUs 914 and 915, special  
5 Brooklyn Navy Yard District, and LUs 918 and 919,  
6 SoHo, NoHo Neighborhood Plan.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with  
8 modification and referred to City Planning Commission  
9 pursuant to Section 197D of the New York City  
10 Charter.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 922 Bed-Stuy East and  
12 Weeksville [sic] Mosaic.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
14 Orders.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 923, health and fitness  
16 citywide text amendment.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
18 Orders.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 924, fresh two zoning  
20 text amendment, LUs 925 and 926, 10316 Vanwick [sp?]  
21 Expressway rezoning, and LUs 929 and 930 River Ring  
22 [sp?].

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with  
24 modifications and referred to the City Planning

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 141

2 Commission pursuant to Section 197D of the New York  
3 City Charter.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 931 and Reso 1848,  
5 Stapleton Beacon article.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
7 Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 932 through 936 River  
9 Ring.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with  
11 modifications and referred to the City Planning  
12 Commission pursuant to section 197D of the New York  
13 City Charter.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 937 and Reso 1849B, 79  
15 Self Storage rezoning.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
17 Orders.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 938, 16005 Arch  
19 Avenue.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with  
21 modifications and referred to the City Planning  
22 Commission pursuant to Section 197D of the New York  
23 City Charter.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 944 and  
25 Reso 1850, New York City Law Department office space.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 142

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled to be filed  
3 pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 945 and  
5 Reso 1851 through Preconsidered LU 948 and Reso 1854,  
6 school facilities.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
8 Orders.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 949 and  
10 Reso 1855, Coney Island Amusement Park.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved and laid over.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LUs 950 and  
13 951, 79 Quay [sp?] Street.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with  
15 modifications and referred to the City Planning  
16 Commission pursuant to Section 197D of the New York  
17 City Charter.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 952 and  
19 Reso 1856 and Preconsidered LU 953 and Reso 1857,  
20 31<sup>st</sup> Street and Hight [sp?] Avenue rezoning.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
22 Orders.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 954 and  
24 Reso 1858 and Preconsidered LU 955 and Reso 1859,  
25 4520 83<sup>rd</sup> Street.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 143

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General

3 Orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 956 and

5 Reso 1860 and LU 957 and Reso 1861, One White [sic]

6 Avenue.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General

8 Orders.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee

10 on Mental Health, Disabilities and Addiction, Intro

11 2141A removing outdated clinic language.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on

13 General Orders.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2442A Office of

15 Community Mental Health.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on

17 General Orders.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on

19 Parks and Recreation, Intro 2366A, tree inspections.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on

21 General Orders.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee

23 on Public Safety, Intro 2297A, Police Department

24 qualifications.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 144

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
3 General Orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2440A Civilian  
5 Complaint Review Board.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
7 General Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
9 on Rules, Privileges, and Elections M346 and Reso  
10 1862, approving the appointment of Leah Goodrich,  
11 Planning Commission.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
13 Orders.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: M347 Reso 1863 approving  
15 the appointment of Joseph Twig [sp?], Planning  
16 Commission.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
18 Orders.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
20 on Transportation, Intro 9A, traffic control devices  
21 near schools.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
23 General Orders.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro. 1724A, passing  
25 stopped school buses.



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 145

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
3 General Orders with a message of necessity.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2201A use of  
5 photographic evidence by motorcyclists.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
7 General Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2417A, prohibiting  
9 the obscuring of licenses plates.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
11 General Orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
13 on Veterans, Intro 479A and 2354B, City veteran  
14 benefits and Veterans Advisory Board.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
16 General Orders.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
18 on Women and Gender Equity, Intro 1085B Civil Legal  
19 Services for domestic violence survivors.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
21 General Orders.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2372B, Gender  
23 Motivated Violence Act.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
25 General Orders.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 146

2 COUNCIL CLERK: General Orders Calendar

3 LU 911 and Reso 1864, citywide hotels text amendment.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General

5 Orders.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: General Orders Calendar

7 LU 916 and Reso 1865 and LU 917 and Reso 1866, 506

8 Third Avenue.

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General

10 Orders.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: General Orders Calendar

12 LU 920 and Reso 1867 and LU 921 and Reso 1868,

13 Starrett-LeHigh terminal warehouse rezoning.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General

15 Orders.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution appointing

17 various persons Commissioner of Deeds.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General

19 Orders. And at this time, I am asking for the Clerk

20 to take a roll call vote on all of the items coupled

21 on today's General Order Calendar. Let's get this

22 done.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?

24

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 147

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Mr. Speaker,  
3 thank you Madam Majority Leader. I proudly eye on  
4 all of today's agenda items. Thank you so much.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thanks Vanessa.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Adams?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: [inaudible]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
9 granted. Because it's your birthday.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: [inaudible] Thank  
11 you, Madam Majority Leader. Today, one of the many  
12 important bills we're voting on is Introduction 2440,  
13 my bill to empower the Civilian Complaint Review  
14 Board to initiate its own complaints and  
15 investigations for allegations of police officer  
16 misconduct. Currently, the CCRB only has the  
17 authority to conduct an investigation in response to  
18 complaints filed by a member of the public. This  
19 longstanding policy, however, unfairly places the  
20 burden on the victims of officer wrong-doing and can  
21 lead to long delays for these investigations.  
22 Members of the public often do not file complaints to  
23 the CCRB for a variety of reasons, including fear of  
24 retaliation or just not knowing where to begin.  
25 Introduction 2440 will change this by allowing the

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 148  
2 agency to be proactive and not have to wait before  
3 they take action. As the nation's largest civilian  
4 oversight agency, the CCRB has the important  
5 responsibility of looking into and issuing findings  
6 for bad behavior, including excessive use of force,  
7 abuse of authority, bias-based policing, and racial  
8 profiling. Enhancing their authority will lead to  
9 greater accountability when it comes to public  
10 safety. As a council we have passed many great  
11 reforms on policing this past year, and this is the  
12 latest reform that will make a difference for all New  
13 Yorkers. I urge all of my colleagues to support this  
14 long over-due, but common sense, legislation. Thank  
15 you, Speaker Johnson, for your leadership and Chief  
16 Of Staff Jason Goldman. Special thanks to Committee  
17 Counsel Josh Kingsley and Matthew Thompson [sp?] for  
18 your work, and lastly, my Chief of Staff and my  
19 Legislative Director Jamal Wilkerson [sp?] and  
20 Benjamin Fang [sp?]. Thank you very much, Madam  
21 Majority Leader.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye on all.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Ampry-Samuel?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 149

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel votes aye on  
3 all. Thank you. Ayala?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ayala  
6 votes aye on all. Barron?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to  
8 explain my vote?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
10 granted.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. As I  
12 started saying, my Legislative Director and CUNY  
13 Liaison, Indigo Washington will be leaving. Tomorrow  
14 is her last day. She did start with my husband,  
15 Charles Barron, in 2009 and has been instrumental in  
16 supporting our legislation, our committee hearings,  
17 Women's Caucus, and the BLAC and CUNY agenda. And  
18 most people will know that she's been quite  
19 instrumental in organizing and pushing for the union  
20 effort for staffing. She will be working with the  
21 incoming Senator Cordell Clear [sp?] in Harlem where  
22 she resides, and I just wanted to wish her the best  
23 as she goes through her new path. She's been very  
24 helpful all of this time, and we're going to miss  
25 her.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 150

2 [applause]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Regarding my  
4 vote. I vote aye on all with the exception of 918,  
5 919, which I'm voting no, and I abstain on 906, 907,  
6 908, 909, 929, 930. And I vote no on 2440, which was  
7 just referenced. The reason I vote no on that is  
8 because it in fact violates our policy of first in  
9 time. This portion of the bill is a part of the  
10 Community Power Act which says, "police oversight  
11 with elected review," and this portion of that  
12 elected review board calls for exactly this. I stated  
13 previously my objection to the violation of policy  
14 this body regarding first in time, and if in fact, my  
15 bill as a part of the ECR bill was reported first, it  
16 should have had a standing, it should have had a  
17 vote, and that did not happen, and I object  
18 vehemently to that. I think that extracting pieces  
19 of the ECR bill is designed to eviscerate the bill,  
20 water the bills down, and take away the meat and the  
21 substance of the bill, and for that reason I'm voting  
22 no, and I encourage my colleagues who understand what  
23 process is and how important it is--

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] Thank  
25 you.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 151

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: to vote no on

3 2440. Thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council

5 Member Barron.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye on all.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brooks-

9 Powers?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I vote aye

11 on all.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Cabán?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [inaudible]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission

15 granted. Please come forward.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you,

17 Majority Leader. I'm honored to be here at my first

18 Stated Meeting.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: One moment.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Better? Great.

21 Thank you, Majority Leader. Honored to be here at my

22 first Stated Meeting and grateful for all of the help

23 the Speaker, Jason, and staff have provided to make

24 this transition as seamless as possible. Thrilled to

25 not only have had an opportunity to vote for the

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 152  
2 landmark Our City Our Vote bill, but the other great  
3 bills on the agenda today. Congratulations to my new  
4 colleagues on their work to make our streets safer,  
5 expand access to contraception, and create a  
6 Supportive Housing Tenant's Bill of Rights. We're  
7 also voting today on a Land Use project in my  
8 district. My predecessor worked on the project for  
9 years, a project that will bring affordable housing  
10 and significant community space to a transit-rich  
11 part of the district. And while I came in in the  
12 ninth inning of this project, in these final few days  
13 we were able to get a commitment from the applicant  
14 to fund a quarter of a million dollars of  
15 improvements to the playground across the street.  
16 Going forward, I'm excited to work on Land Use  
17 projects that further the vision of housing as a  
18 human right, and universal public good, not a vehicle  
19 for the profits of developers and landlords. That's  
20 how we affirm the dignity and wellbeing of working  
21 class New Yorkers and cultivate the strong community  
22 bonds that are the cornerstone of true public safety.  
23 So I vote aye on all with the exception of Intro  
24 1724A, in which I vote no. Thanks.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 153

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Cabrera?

3 Carr?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: I'm going to be  
5 voting no on Introduction 1621A, 2309A, 2440A, and  
6 M346 with accompanying Resolution 1862, and then aye  
7 on the rest.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Chin?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye on all.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Chin votes  
11 aye on all. Cornegy?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Darma Diaz?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye on all.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Ruben Diaz,  
16 Senior? Dinowitz?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Permission to  
18 explain my vote?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
20 granted.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I just want to  
22 take a quick moment. One of the bills we're voting  
23 on today is a charter revision on which I'm prime  
24 sponsor. I want take a moment to thank Bianca Vitale  
25 and Elizabeth Arzt, as well as Jenna Klous [sp?] and

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 154  
2 Mike Corbit [sp?] for their work on this legislation  
3 which will expand the Veterans Advisory Board to  
4 include family members of veterans and to, you know,  
5 clarify that we support all veterans here in New York  
6 City regardless of their discharge status. And with  
7 that, I vote aye on-- I vote aye on all.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Dromm?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Would like to  
10 thank all of the advocates who are across the street  
11 right now watching the live stream of this who really  
12 came out in support of nuclear disarmament. I thank  
13 you for all that you've done. And with that, I'd  
14 like to say that I vote yes on all. Thank you.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Eugene?  
16 Riley?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Aye on all.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Feliz?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Permission to  
20 explain my vote?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you. Today  
24 I have the honor and the privilege of introducing my  
25 first bill ever, Intro 2459A which establishes the

1                   NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING           155  
2   Office of Information Privacy, an office that will  
3   implement and oversee privacy protection policies in  
4   the City of New York. The great people of our city  
5   provide sensitive information to our government  
6   agencies every single day and in so many different  
7   ways. They do it when applying to our public  
8   schools, when they are obtaining healthcare services,  
9   and also even when they are seeking legal services.  
10  They provide their most private information. And  
11  also, many of the agencies even share information to  
12  be able to quickly and effectively provide services.  
13  By creating the Office of Information Privacy, we  
14  will help make sure that sensitive information  
15  provided to our agencies is truly kept private.  
16  It'll also help ensure that people can continue to  
17  see government services with trust, trust that their  
18  private information will be kept private. For those  
19  reasons, I proudly vote yes on my bill Intro 2459A,  
20  and I encourage everybody else to vote yes as well.  
21  And I also vote yes on the rest of the bills. Thank  
22  you.

23                   COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you and  
24  congratulations.

25                   COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 156

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gennaro?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gjonaj?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye on all.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Grodenchik?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Not bad for

8 an old guy. Aye on all.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, sir. Holden?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Permission to

11 explain?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission

13 granted.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So I vote aye on

15 all with the exception of Intro 2440, Intro 1763,

16 Intro 2265, and Reso 976. No also on LU 918 and LU

17 919. I'd just like to make a few comments on my

18 Intro 2417, which is really prohibiting the

19 obstructing of the license plates, now a common

20 practice for career criminals who routinely use

21 products that distort or hide license plates from

22 cameras and law enforcement agencies. Many of these

23 products can be purchased from well-known online

24 realtors-- retailers, I'm sorry. The bill will

25 prohibit the sale or distribution of any materials or

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 157  
2 substance with purposes to conceal or obscure the  
3 license plate numbers and so forth. We're seeing a  
4 lot of that. The way this happened, I was driving in  
5 my neighborhood and right in front of us was a car, a  
6 SUV, that went into the other lane speeding, and was  
7 attempting to go through the traffic light, and he  
8 had a curtain that came down like James Bond over the  
9 license plate. And by the way, they get that on  
10 Amazon. I've already spoken to Amazon. They are  
11 going to discontinue the sale before this becomes  
12 law, but I just want to urge all my colleagues to  
13 vote Intro 2417 which would make this illegal to  
14 sell, these contraptions, in the City of New York. I  
15 want to thank, by the way, Speaker Corey Johnson and  
16 many of the cosponsors on this bill. We had 29, I  
17 believe, 29 cosponsors of all, you know, both sides  
18 of the aisle. I also want to thank Jason Goldman,  
19 obviously, the Chief of Staff, Legislative Director  
20 Jeff Baker, Transportation Committee Chair Rodriguez,  
21 my Chief of Staff Daniel Carzina [sp?], and my  
22 Legislative Director Craig Carawana [sp?]. Thank you  
23 so much.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 158

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Kallos

3 votes aye on all. Council Member Koo?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye on all.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Koslowitz?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Lander?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request

9 permission to explain my vote?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission

11 granted. Where'd you go?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you. I want  
13 to congratulate and welcome Council Member Vernikov,  
14 Carr, and Cabán. Our city will be better [inaudible]  
15 service. Congratulations to the [inaudible] debate  
16 and disagreement is good in a democratic body. I'm  
17 going to vote no on Intro 1724A. While motorists  
18 should never pass a school bus, mercifully, this  
19 behavior has not been linked to serious injuries or  
20 fatalities in New York City, and I'm concerned about  
21 the potential of this bill to open up the possibility  
22 of the privatization of enforcement, and the  
23 expansion of fees and fines for revenue purposes. In  
24 Suffolk County where this bill was implemented, 45  
25 percent of the fee revenue collected went to the

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 159  
2 vendor. I care a lot about and believe we should  
3 engage in automated enforcement, but I think we have  
4 to be really judicious in how we do it. I'm also  
5 very enthusiastic about the nuclear disarmament  
6 bills. Congratulations Danny Dromm. I pledge as New  
7 York City Comptroller to work with this community and  
8 explore the divestment of the New York City pension  
9 funds from the sale and development of nuclear  
10 weapons. I vote aye on the rest.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: My apologies, Council  
12 Member Lander, could you repeat that. My apologies.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: No on 1724, aye  
14 on the rest.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, sir.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to  
19 explain, Madam Majority Leader?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission  
21 granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
23 much. Today, the Council's voting on two bills that  
24 I'm proud to sponsor, Intro 147A which requires the  
25 Department of Social Services to produce an annual

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 160  
2 report of supportive housing placements, Proposed  
3 Intro 2176A which requires that a bill of rights be  
4 distributed to supportive housing tenants. Our city  
5 is facing a homelessness crisis and supportive  
6 housing is considered the most successful existing  
7 model for ending chronic homelessness among  
8 vulnerable populations. It is a lynchpin in the  
9 fight for successful housing. Residents have a place  
10 to call home and an environment that provides direct  
11 case management and access to mental health  
12 providers. This integrated service model enables  
13 people to connect to the programs that are right for  
14 them and access care that they deserve. Simply put,  
15 supportive housing is housing for those most in need.  
16 Because it is so important, it is our responsibility  
17 to make sure that we are upholding the highest  
18 standards for residents who are vulnerable and  
19 maintaining adequate accountability. Some advocates  
20 have argued that the easiest to serve clients are  
21 accepted in supportive housing, and we need to be  
22 targeting our approach to house those most in need of  
23 care. Intro 147A will require DSS to produce an  
24 annual report on the number of individuals eligible  
25 for, referred to, accepted, and rejected for



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 161  
2 supportive housing placement and the reason the  
3 client has been rejected for placement. This data  
4 will help us to figure out together if there are any  
5 hiccups in the system or communities who are being  
6 underserved and opportunities for improvement. In  
7 addition, 2176A would require DSS to provide a notice  
8 to supportive housing residents of their rights  
9 pursuant to various state and local laws. This bill  
10 would help improve transparency and ensure supportive  
11 housing tenants know their rights. I'm a strong  
12 supporter of supportive housing. It's a proven  
13 valuable resource in addressing street homelessness.  
14 These bills will help ensure that supportive housing  
15 programs are successful and reach the target  
16 populations so that those most in need are supported  
17 are well served. I just want to thank Speaker Corey  
18 Johnson, Chief of Staff Jason Goldman, my staff,  
19 committee staff, and all the advocates that worked on  
20 this legislation. Thank you very much. I vote aye  
21 on all.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote aye on  
25 all.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 162

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Louis?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I vote aye on all.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Maisel?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes on all,

6 accept no on 1621.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Menchaca?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to

9 explain my vote?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission

11 granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I want to bring

13 in some remarks that I was going to make during

14 general discussions. One, I think not only I'm so

15 happy that we passed the bill. there's going to be

16 future discussions, and I won't be here as a Council

17 Member to be part of those future discussions, but as

18 I listened to today's debate about the amendment

19 time-- or another amendment that may come to the

20 floor around 30 days, I just want to say this: I

21 think-- it feels wrong to segregate a population that

22 are New Yorkers and giving them a different timeline

23 to get access to the same right. Separate but not

24 equal is real, and we've discussed that as a country.

25 And so I hope that echoes in this chamber after I

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 163  
2 leave. I also want to say thank you to Speaker  
3 Johnson and Jason. They did a lot to lift for the  
4 bill that we just passed, Our City Our Vote, and I  
5 didn't say thank you to them, and I just want to say  
6 thank you. Next, I don't want to-- I want to speak  
7 on a budget item. Key to the City has been something  
8 that has been so strong in commitment from this  
9 Council, but it was defunded during our budget  
10 crisis. There was a lot of opposition in the BNT  
11 about this, and I'm so happy that today we're going  
12 to be restoring Key to the City to the New York  
13 Immigration Coalition at 700,000 dollars, and we  
14 heard your concerns. We have reshaped the program  
15 and it fits so well and how we are thinking about Our  
16 City Our Vote, because this is going to support new  
17 immigrants, newly arrived immigrants, refugees, and  
18 indigenous speaking communities to overcome the  
19 language and cultural barriers so that they get  
20 access to education, public health benefits, and  
21 seeking mental health services. Legal services will  
22 also be part of how they connect to the City of New  
23 York. When we're talking about the new immigrants  
24 we've just enfranchised, those who are legally  
25 permanent residents, this is a part of what the

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 164

2 Council has done and is committed to. And I want to  
3 say thank you to Moya and Salamanca who had a lot of  
4 concerns, and I'm so thankful that they are  
5 supportive of this. I am voting no on Land Use item  
6 918 and 919. This is the SoHo/NoHo rezoning plan  
7 that the mayor has pushed. Thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller? Moya?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Powers?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Reynoso?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye on

15 all.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rivera?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Permission to

18 explain my vote?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission

20 granted.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you for the  
22 opportunity to speak with you today to make history  
23 and take care of our neighbors. I'll proudly be  
24 voting aye on all of the bills, and especially proud  
25 to bring municipal voting to New York City. In

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 165  
2 everything I do I prioritize building a future for  
3 New York City that is safe, equitable, and inclusive.  
4 I have several pieces of legislation before the body  
5 today that help achieve that goal, and to be  
6 introducing three new bills that will create big  
7 positive change for New Yorkers. The first bill  
8 known as the LARC Bill, that we'll be-- that we have  
9 voted on today. It requires city health clinics to  
10 provide long-acting reversible contraception, or  
11 LARC, to all New Yorkers regardless of ability to  
12 pay, making New York City the leader in access to  
13 reproductive healthcare that we know we are. In  
14 acknowledgment of our nation's history of forced  
15 sterilization, specifically in the Puerto Rican  
16 community. This bill also mandates DOHMH provide  
17 culturally sensitive education on LARC options  
18 because true access includes informed decision  
19 making. Introduction 2372B, my bill with the  
20 phenomenal Council Member Selvena Brooks-Powers,  
21 offers a path to healing for survivors who have been  
22 failed by the very institutions tasked to protect  
23 them by creating a two-year look-back window for  
24 survivors of gender-motivated violence to file civil  
25 actions against their assailants under the Gender-

1                   NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING           166  
2           motivated Violence Protection Act of 2000, even if  
3           the statute of limitations in the case has already  
4           expired. As New Yorkers, we pride ourselves on being  
5           ahead of the curb, but when it comes to codified  
6           language on disability, we are woefully behind. My  
7           other bill, Introduction 2141 removes clinically  
8           outdated derogatory terms from our city's health  
9           laws, replacing them with language that ensures the  
10          city can provide inclusive, person-first services to  
11          all New Yorkers. And finally, my last bill, 2201  
12          brings a long overdue solution for bureaucratic  
13          challenges facing motorcyclists. I'm so happy and  
14          pleased that we're voting on these four bills today.  
15          Thank you to everyone who voted aye. I encourage the  
16          rest of y'all to do the same, and to sign onto the  
17          three bills I am also proudly introducing, including  
18          Hotels to Housing, a game-changing bill to increase  
19          our affordable housing stock. Thank you so much. I  
20          proudly vote aye.

21                   COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

22                   COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council  
23          Member Miller?

24                   COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Good evening. I  
25          will be voting aye on all with the exceptions of 1724

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 167

2 for which I will be voting no, and 2440 which I will  
3 be abstaining.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rodriguez?

7 Rose?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I vote aye on all.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rosenthal?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: With

11 congratulations to my colleagues, aye on all.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Salamanca?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Treyger?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to

16 explain my vote?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission

18 granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Colleagues, I

20 speak this evening, now, on my bill Intro 1085B, a

21 Local Law in relation to Civil Legal Services for

22 domestic violence survivors who are a party to a

23 divorce proceeding. The bill was introduced in

24 August of 2018. The world has changed a lot since

25 then, but unfortunately, with the pandemic we know

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 168  
2 domestic violence has only gotten worse. In May of  
3 2018 the New York Times wrote an article called  
4 "Their Husbands Abuse Them, Shouldn't Divorce Be  
5 Easy." This article gave a harrowing insight into  
6 the struggles so many women face when they seek a  
7 divorce. Because of this historic bill, victims and  
8 survivors of domestic violence can focus on their  
9 safety without having to worry about the cost of a  
10 divorce. The bill will offer free legal services for  
11 domestic violence survivors who are party to a  
12 divorce proceeding. Your safety shouldn't be  
13 determined by your income. No one should have to  
14 stay in an abusive marriage, simply because they  
15 can't afford a divorce lawyer, and as we know,  
16 domestic violence impacts all of our communities  
17 across the city. This is an important bill, and I  
18 ask my colleagues to vote aye. I want to thank Chair  
19 Darma Diaz, Brenda McKinney, Chloe Rivera, Smita  
20 Deshmukh, Anna [inaudible] my Chief of Staff, Vanessa  
21 Ogle [sp?], Maria Henderson, and with that, I vote  
22 aye with the exception of 2440, where I vote no.  
23 Thank you, Majority Leader.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?



1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 169

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Madam Majority  
3 Leader, I'd like to vote aye on all with the  
4 exception of Introduction 1621A, 1867A, 2309A, 2440A,  
5 and M346 with accompanying Resolution 1862, and aye  
6 on the rest as I mentioned. Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I vote no on  
10 2440 and aye on all the rest, and everyone safely  
11 [sic] home. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Van Bramer?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Vernikov?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Madam Majority  
16 Leader, no on Introduction 1621, 2309, 2440, and M346  
17 with accompanying Reso 1862, and aye on the rest.  
18 Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President,  
22 may I be excused to explain my vote?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you very  
25 much. First off, I neglected to say publicly what I

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 170  
2 said privately, just welcome to my new colleagues,  
3 our new colleagues, Council Member Cabán, Carr,  
4 Vernikov with whom I share a larger border. I look  
5 forward to working with you all. You know, I look  
6 around the room and it's-- is that clock right? It's  
7 5:50, and you know, there was a member of this body  
8 once that suggested that Council Members ought to get  
9 paid overtime-- I don't agree with that, by the way,  
10 I disagree with that.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I disagree with  
13 that. Council Members should not get paid overtime.  
14 To be clear, that's my position. That Council Member  
15 is not in the room now because they're busy outside  
16 doing interviews, because that's the way they feel  
17 that their job is. Our job is in here or in our  
18 community, not shilling for the press and making our  
19 points for the camera and the picture. Not you, Joe,  
20 relax. I vote aye on all with the exception of  
21 Introduction 2458. Very briefly, I typically vote  
22 against the increase of bid assessments because those  
23 are taxes. Those are taxes that have to be assessed  
24 on people who do business in those neighborhood  
25 because the City refuses to provide the basic

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 171  
2 services that are necessary. It shouldn't be that  
3 way. People pay taxes, they ought to get the  
4 services. So I'm voting no on 2458. I'm voting no  
5 on 2440, no LU 911 with accompanying Resolution 1864.  
6 Voting no on Introduction 2309 for the reasons I said  
7 at committee on that, I believe. I am voting no  
8 Introduction 2460. I am voting no on LU 918 and 919,  
9 LU 924, and I'm abstaining on Introduction 1621 for  
10 the reasons I stated at Committee. And I have one  
11 more no vote, excuse me. Usually better at this. I  
12 vote no on Introduction M346 and accompanying  
13 Resolution 1862. Thank you very much Madam  
14 President.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Always problems,  
18 huh? Always problems. I vote aye on all except  
19 1621A, 2309, 2440A, and M346 with accompanying  
20 Resolution 1862. Good night everyone.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Last call, Cabrera?  
22 Ruben Diaz, Senior? Perkins? Rodriguez? Eugene?  
23 Council Member Eugene?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, sir. Cumbo?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 172

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye on all.

5 Folks that are on Zoom, we still need you. We have a

6 Resolution. So please don't leave.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: All items of

8 today's-- order, excuse me. Can we have quiet in the

9 Chamber? All items on today's General Order Calendar

10 are adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 0

11 negative and 0 abstentions, with the exception of

12 Intro 2440-A which was adopted by a vote of 37 in the

13 affirmative, 9 negative, and 1 abstention. Intro

14 1621A which was adopted by a vote of 41 in the

15 affirmative, 5 negative, and 1 abstention, and Intro

16 1724A which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the

17 affirmative, 3 negative, 0 abstentions. And intro

18 2309 which was adopted by a vote of 42 in the

19 affirmative, 5 negative and 0 abstentions. And M346

20 and Resolution 1862 which was adopted by a vote of 42

21 in the affirmative, 5 negative, and 0 abstentions.

22 And Intro 2458 which was adopted by a vote of 46 in

23 the affirmative, 1 negative, and 0 abstentions. And

24 LU 911 and Resolution 1864 which was adopted by a

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 173

2 vote of 46 in the affirmative, 1 negative, and 0  
3 abstentions. Introduction and reading of bills.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills are referred  
5 to committees as indicated on today's agenda.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. We'll  
7 now move into discussion of Resolutions. Are there  
8 any Council Members that have signed up to speak on  
9 today's Resolutions? There are no members that wish  
10 to speak on today's resolution. If we could please  
11 have quiet in the Chamber? We are now going to move  
12 into a voice vote on today's Resolution. If you wish  
13 to vote against or abstain from today's Resolution,  
14 please notify the Legislative Documents Unit by email  
15 right now. I'll now read today's Resolution into the  
16 record. Resolution 976A calls on the New York City  
17 Comptroller to instruct the pension funds of public  
18 employees in the New York City to divest from an  
19 avoid any financial exposure to companies involved in  
20 the production and maintenance of nuclear weapons.  
21 Reaffirms New York City as a nuclear weapons-free  
22 zone. Joins the ICAN [sic] City's appeal and calls  
23 on the United States to support and join the treaty  
24 on the prohibition of nuclear weapons. Will all  
25 those in favor please say aye?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 174

2 ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: All opposed say  
4 nay. Hard to tell sometimes. Any abstentions? The  
5 ayes have it. We will now move into General  
6 Discussion. Are there any members that wish to speak  
7 on General Discussion? I'm informing Speaker Johnson  
8 that we have 12 members ready to speak on General--

9 [laughter]

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader,  
11 I move to replace the Chair for the rest of the  
12 meeting.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We have Council  
14 Member Kallos.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: No we don't.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Seeing as we have  
17 no members signed up to speak on General Discussion,  
18 I will now call on Speaker Corey Johnson to close  
19 today's Stated Meeting.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader,  
21 you didn't use all the time on your clock in remarks  
22 earlier, so if you want to-- the Stated Meeting of  
23 December 9<sup>th</sup>, 2021 is hereby adjourned. One Stated  
24 Meeting left. Thank you all very much.

25 [gavel]

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 175

2

3 [TRANSCRIBER'S NOTE] VOTE CLARIFICATION:

4 Introduction 2460 is adopted by the Council with 46

5 in the affirmative, 1 negative, and zero abstentions.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1	NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING	176
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		



C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 13, 2022